

**U.S. Department of Homeland Security**  
Homeland Security Advisory Council Meeting  
Monday, July 18, 2022  
Meeting Minutes  
12:00 p.m. – 12:20 p.m. EST

The open session of the Homeland Security Advisory Council (HSAC) meeting was convened on July 18, 2022 from 12:00 p.m. to 12:20 p.m. The meeting was open to members of the public under the provisions of the Federal Advisory Committee Act (FACA), P.L. 92-463 and 5 U.S.C. § 552b.

The following individuals attended the meeting:

**HSAC Members**

William Bratton (Co-Chair)  
Jamie Gorelick (Co-Chair)  
Karen Tandy (Vice-Chair)  
Jayson Ahern  
Dimitri Alperovitch  
Tarika Barrett  
Noah Bookbinder  
Catherine Chen  
Michael Chertoff  
Jane Harman  
Scott Kirby  
Carrie A. Lemack  
Michael Masters  
Leon Panetta  
Ali Soufan  
Todd Stern  
Vincent Talucci  
Lynda Williams  
Wendy Young

**HSAC Subcommittee Member**

Matthew Ferraro

**DHS Participants**

Jen Easterly, Director, Cybersecurity and Infrastructure Security Agency (CISA)  
Samantha Vinograd, (A) Assistant Secretary  
Luis Miranda, (A) Deputy Assistant Secretary  
Ricki Seidman, Advisor to the Secretary  
Christopher Wright, Senior Counselor  
Andrew Fausett, Assistant General Counsel, Office of General Counsel  
Brian Puchalsky, Attorney Advisor, Office of General Counsel  
Jill Mueller, Assistant Director, Office of Legislative Affairs

Lucas Hitt, Deputy Director, Office of External Affairs, FEMA  
Hannah Vick, Senior Advisor, Office of External Affairs, FEMA  
Brian Sterling, Section Chief, Civil Rights and Civil Liberties  
Kevin Quinn, Senior Policy Advisor, Civil Rights and Civil Liberties  
Jason Lamote, Office of Legislative Affairs, CISA  
Charmaine Lee Sessoms, Special Assistant, CISA  
Jason Mayer, Executive Director, Homeland Security Advisory Council  
Rebecca Sternhell, Executive Director, Homeland Security Advisory Council  
Mike Miron, Deputy Executive Director, Homeland Security Advisory Council  
Joseph Chilbert, Senior Director, Homeland Security Advisory Council  
Alexander Jacobs, Senior Director, Homeland Security Advisory Council  
Amanda Dobruck, Student Intern, Homeland Security Advisory Council  
Joseph Cofer, Student Intern, Office of Partnership and Engagement  
Malak Kalasho, Student Intern, Office of Partnership and Engagement  
Rose Jacques, Student Intern, Office of Partnership and Engagement

**Jason Mayer:** Good morning everyone. I'd ask that you make sure you mute your cell phones during the call. And with that, I'll turn it over to Commissioner Bratton for some opening remarks.

**William Bratton:** Thank you, Jason. My name is William Bratton and I am the co-chair of the Homeland Security Advisory Council.

I welcome you to today's public meeting where you will see the draft into a recommendation on the council's Disinformation Best Practices and Safeguards Subcommittee. The subcommittee will deliver their final report to the full council in early August.

I'd like to welcome our HSAC members and also the public we have in attendance along with our HSAC staff who's done a great job to support all the subcommittees.

It's also my pleasure to welcome our incoming HSAC executive director Rebecca Sternhell to DHS. On behalf of Jamie, Karen and myself, we're excited to continue the important work of the council in collaboration with Rebecca and her team.

I'd like to thank Jamie Gorelick and Secretary Michael Chertoff for the leadership and your service as co-chairs to the Disinformation Best Practices and Safeguards Subcommittee along with fellow subcommittee members Ted Schlein, Sonal Shah and Ali Soufan.

Lastly a special thank you to Matthew Ferraro who's a member of the subcommittee in support of drafting the report. Jamie, Michael, I look forward to hearing your presentation.

**Jason Mayer:** Thank you, Commissioner Bratton, for those remarks. I'd also like to thank the HSAC members and members of the public for joining today's public call.

As a reminder we are recording minutes for today's conference call for the public record.

This meeting is convened pursuant to a notice that appeared in the Federal Register on Friday, July 1st, 2022. By way of background, the Homeland Security Advisory Council is a federal advisory committee at the Department of Homeland Security serving as an important group of outside senior advisors to the secretary and the department leadership.

Under the Federal Advisory Committee Act, or FACA, these meetings are open to the public. Executive summary and meeting minutes will be posted on the DHS Web site at dhs.gov and the public FACA database within 90 days of today's meeting. For members of the public, if you wish to do so, you will have a one-minute comment period after the report is briefed by the two committees' co-chairs.

For the record, we have a quorum of HSAC members for today's meeting.

Once the report is briefed, we will take public comments, have council deliberations and vote on the report.

At this time, I'd ask Secretary Michael Chertoff, Co-Chair of the Disinformation Best Practices and Safeguards Subcommittee, to present the interim recommendation.

Secretary Chertoff, the floor is yours.

**Michael Chertoff:** Thank you, Jason. And I just want to thank the members of the subcommittee and my co-chair, Jamie Gorelick, for their work on this project.

Let me begin by summarizing the tasking that was issued to this working group by Secretary Mayorkas.

The tasking required the Disinformation Best Practices and Safeguards Subcommittee to provide findings and recommendations for the Homeland Security Advisory Council on how the department can most effectively and appropriately address disinformation that poses a threat to the homeland while at the same time increasing transparency on protecting free speech, civil rights, civil liberties and privacy.

The subcommittee's assessment should include but need not be limited to the following: Recommendations for how the department can most effectively and appropriately address disinformation that poses a threat to the homeland while protecting free speech, civil rights, civil liberties and privacy including through proposed unified principles to drive the department's disinformation related work.

And second, recommendations for how to achieve greater transparency across our disinformation related work including to increase trust with the public and other key stakeholders in a way to conserve as a model for achieving transparency in other mission areas.

In terms of our process, the subcommittee has met with leaders and subject matter experts from every DHS component that plays a role in dealing with misinformation, disinformation and mal-information.

These components include the Office of the Secretary, the Privacy Office, Office of Public Affairs, Civil Rights and Civil Liberties Office, Cybersecurity and Infrastructure Security Agency, Office of Intelligence and Analysis, US Customs and Border Protection, The Federal Emergency Management Agency, The Office of Strategy, Policy and Plans and The Office of the General Counsel.

Our interim recommendation pursuant to a specific question from the secretary about the disposition of what has been called the Disinformation Governance Board is as follows: We have now had briefings on the relevant disinformation related activities of the department. We are not ready as of yet to provide recommendations on the department's overall most effective approach to disinformation threats including commitments to increase transparency and protect civil rights, civil liberties and privacy.

However, at this point, we have concluded that there is no need for a separate Disinformation Governance Board.

Before we move to the public session, we'd like to preview the issues we will be addressing in the final report.

First, how to properly define what is and is not disinformation. Second, what is within and outside DHS's authorities to deal with in terms of countering disinformation, some of the analogs across the US government that deal with disinformation, the roles and responsibilities of the various DHS components in the space and finally our recommendations going forward.

We look forward to sharing this final section of our effort with you on August 3rd. And, Jason, I return the floor to you.

**Jason Mayer:** Thank you Secretary.

I'd now like to open the meeting for public comment. Comments will be limited to one minute each. Your comments will be reflected in today's meeting minutes. These are just public comments and not the question-and-answer session.

Operator, can you please prompt the members of the public to determine if there are any public comments?

### **Public Comment**

**Daniel Glucksman:** Hi. This is Dan Glucksman with the International Safety Equipment Association and our members are companies that design, test and manufacture a wide range of PPE including respirators where our members include 3M, Honeywell, Moldex and a few others. And it's an honor to talk to you.

My one comment is we still face a number of misinformation campaigns on respirators. We see that daily. And my comment/question would be that this group liaise and work with NIOSH

especially the NIOSH Personal Protective Technologies Lab which certifies respirators, they're also constantly battling misinformation campaigns whether it's use of respirators to protect against, you know, wildfire smoke or COVID. I think that the combined efforts of this group and other agencies and the government could help yield real results sooner rather than later. Thank you very much. Bye-bye.

**Jason Mayer:** I will now open it up to members of the HSAC for comments on the report. Members please state your name and share your comments or question on the recommendation. I'll ask the co-chairs to join me in moderating the discussion.

**Leon Panetta:** Can we be recognized for a comment?

**Jason Mayer:** Yes please.

**Leon Panetta:** Yes, this is Secretary Panetta. Can I just get a summary of exactly what we're concluding here? I assume the conclusion is we do not need a Disinformation Governance Board but I assume that there is work to be done with regards to recommendations as to how we deal with disinformation threats. Is that correct?

**Michael Chertoff:** That is correct. And that's what we will provide in anticipation of finalizing report the first week of August.

**Jason Mayer:** Any other comments or questions from the members of the HSAC?

If there's no more discussion, if there are motion for the HSAC to approve the interim draft recommendation ascend to the secretary?

**Ali Soufan:** I move that we approve the motion

**Jason Mayer:** Thank you, Mr. Soufan. Is there a second?

**Karen Tandy:** Second.

**Jason Mayer:** Thank you, Karen, for the second.

At this time those in favor of approving the recommendations, please indicate "aye" verbally.

**Multiple HSAC Members:** Aye.

**Jason Mayer:** Those opposed please indicate "nay."

Thank you. Those abstaining?

Thank you. A reminder that the final meeting on the 3rd of August for this subgroup will be meeting at 3 o'clock - the FRN went public today and the meeting is at 3 o'clock on the 3rd of August.

The report is approved. For the record, the recommendation passed by acclamation.

Members of the public who would like to provide questions or additional comments and that includes the media they do so via e-mail to [hsac@hq.dhs.gov](mailto:hsac@hq.dhs.gov).

HSAC information and meeting minutes may be found at [dhs.gov/hsac](https://dhs.gov/hsac).

Commissioner Bratton, I now yield to you to close our session.

**William Bratton:** I want to thank the advisory council members and members of the public for attending today. The recommendation and findings will be transmitted to the secretary for his consideration in the coming days.

We are now going to bring this public session to a close. This meeting is now adjourned. Thank you.

**JASON D  
MAYER**

Digitally signed by JASON  
D MAYER  
Date: 2022.07.25  
10:42:47 -04'00'

Jason Mayer, Executive Director, Homeland Security Advisory Council