



## Transcript of **Public Meeting**

Tuesday, January 31, 2023

*Meeting of the Data Privacy and Integrity Advisory Committee*

www.TP.One  
www.aldersonreporting.com  
www.accutrancer.com  
800.FOR.DEPO (800.367.3376)  
Scheduling@TP.One

Reference Number: 124891

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22

U.S. DEPARTMENT OF HOMELAND SECURITY

MEETING OF THE DATA PRIVACY AND INTEGRITY ADVISORY  
COMMITTEE

PUBLIC MEETING

Virtual Meeting

9:00 a.m.

Tuesday, January 31, 2023

U.S. Department of Homeland Security

2701 Martin Luther King Jr. Ave. SE, Mail Stop 0655

Washington, DC 20598-0655

1	CONTENTS	
2	AGENDA ITEM	PAGE
3	CALL TO ORDER	4
4	William "Bill" Bice, Alternate Designated	
5	Federal Official, U.S. Department of Homeland	
6	Security	
7	OPENING REMARKS	4
8	Mary Ellen Callahan, Chief of Staff to the	
9	Office of the Deputy Secretary at the U.S.	
10	Department of Homeland Security	
11	John Tien, Deputy Secretary, U.S. Department	
12	of Homeland Security	
13	ROLL CALL	10
14	William "Bill" Bice	
15	CHAIRPERSON REMARKS	13
16	Lisa Sotto, Chairperson, Data Privacy and	
17	Integrity Advisory Committee	
18	UPDATE ON PRIVACY OFFICE ACTIVITIES AND	
19	2023 PRIORITIES	14
20	Lynn Parker Dupree, Chief Privacy Officer,	
21	U.S. Department of Homeland Security	
22		

1	CONTENTS (continued)	
2	AGENDA ITEM	PAGE
3	PRIVACY ENHANCING TECHNOLOGIES UPDATE	20
4	Ross Maciejewski, Director of the Center for	
5	Accelerating Operational Efficiency, U.S.	
6	Department of Homeland Security Center of	
7	Excellence	
8	COMMERCIAL DATA TASKING UPDATE/NEXT STEPS	38
9	Chris Teitzel, Chair, Technology Subcommittee,	
10	Data Privacy and Integrity Advisory Committee	
11	QUESTIONS FROM MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC	42
12	CLOSING STATEMENTS AND MEETING ADJOURNMENT	43
13		
14		
15		
16		
17		
18		
19		
20		
21		
22		

1                                    P R O C E E D I N G S

2                    Mr. Bice: All right. Good morning,  
3 everyone, and welcome. It is 9:00 and this is the  
4 public meeting of the Data Privacy Integrity  
5 Advisory Committee. We are now called to order.

6                    We have committee members and members of  
7 the public joining us today. If you have any  
8 difficulties hearing or seeing at any time please  
9 let me know. And please remember to mute your mics  
10 and turn off your camera until it is time for the  
11 Q&A or public comment.

12                    The meeting and materials and agenda for  
13 today's session are on the DPIAC website. Please  
14 look under Meeting Information.

15                    And before I take roll I believe we have  
16 some guests here to join us. So take it away.

17                    [Pause.]

18                    Ms. Callahan: Hello, all. This is a  
19 blast from the past, Mary Ellen Callahan. I am the  
20 chief of staff to the Deputy Secretary of the  
21 Department of Homeland Security, and he should be  
22 joining in just a second. We are just jumping on

1 to say a few kind words at the beginning of your  
2 DPIAC. Very nice to see lots of familiar faces, or  
3 names at least, not faces. But I thought I'd throw  
4 my face on just for a minute.

5 Speak of the devil. Good morning, sir.  
6 Hi. I was vamping until you got on.

7 Mr. Tien: Good morning. Good morning.

8 Ms. Callahan: So sir, they've thrown it  
9 to us to start things off, to make a few opening  
10 remarks.

11 Mr. Tien: Okay. Great. Sorry. I  
12 apologize for being a minute late here. Thanks  
13 very much.

14 So interestingly, I don't know that DPIAC  
15 needs to know all of these administrative things,  
16 they have changed our Team setup so it's harder to  
17 tell who is actually on. Are Lynn and Mason on?

18 Ms. Callahan: There she is.

19 Mr. Tien: There's Lynn.

20 Ms. Dupree: Hello.

21 Mr. Tien: Mason? Okay. There we go.

22 Okay. All right, everybody. Thanks very much. We

1 appreciate it.

2 Look, I'll keep my comments pretty short.

3 Number one, I think as you all know, Lynn Parker

4 Dupree is, happily for her, sadly for the

5 Department of Homeland Security, for DHS broadly,

6 and certainly for America, Lynn is moving on to her

7 next great chapter in life. We are all very sad to

8 see her go but again, we are happy for her and her

9 family to be doing this. And the Secretary said

10 similar comments, much longer, much more articulate

11 than me, at a recent meeting with pretty much the

12 entire DHS senior leadership component heads, the

13 commandant of the Coast Guard, and literally all of

14 the component heads were there. We did a great big

15 sendoff for Lynn -- pictures, plaques, everything

16 else like that. And I thought, okay, that's good.

17 I did a picture with Lynn and everything, and then

18 I found out that DPIAC was meeting, and I

19 shoehorned my way in and said, look, I think it

20 would be really good for DPIAC to hear from me,

21 from the Deputy representing the Department,

22 representing the Secretary, that we really

1 appreciate Lynn, your incredible, outstanding  
2 service to the Administration and to the  
3 Department, to the people of America. You have  
4 really made an incredible contribution to not only  
5 your team but again, to the Department, in so many  
6 different ways.

7 I am not going to sit here and disparage  
8 the last administration. Let us just say that it  
9 was tougher sledding for the DHS Privacy Office in  
10 the prior administration, for so many different  
11 reasons, in policy but also in terms of  
12 administration. And Lynn and the team, you know,  
13 that include Mason, will still be here doing the  
14 great work, you really tackled in a monumental  
15 amount of challenges that you all faced, and you  
16 have really brought us back in a great condition.

17 So I just want to echo the Secretary's  
18 comments to you the other day. He was obviously  
19 very gracious, but it is really heartfelt, about  
20 your contributions, and also heartfelt about  
21 wishing you well in your next chapter.

22 Similarly so, since we have the DPIAC on,



1 we welcome Mason Clutter for agreeing to serve as  
2 the acting Chief Privacy Officer. It is terrific.  
3 Mason, thank you for staying on and leading up as  
4 we call it in the military. We do have the Coast  
5 Guard in DHS and I am former military as well. I  
6 had Mason in my office here the other day, and I  
7 know you are ready for the task. Substantively,  
8 you are obviously already in the Privacy Office,  
9 and you know all of the great work that you have  
10 already done, and we will need you to continue to  
11 do that, Mason. So thanks again for doing that. I  
12 look forward to partnering with you.

13           Fortunately for me, I am never that  
14 concerned about what is happening in the Privacy  
15 Office because I will know pretty quickly if they  
16 need my help or if I have done something wrong  
17 because one of my very strategic and one of my  
18 first decisions when I came into the Department a  
19 year and a half ago was to ask Mary Ellen Callahan  
20 to come on as my chief of staff, and also to be the  
21 deputy chief of staff for the Department. Mary  
22 Ellen, thankfully, agreed to that. And so I

1 thought it would be really nice to hand it off to  
2 Mary Ellen, being, as many of you know, the former  
3 Chief Privacy Officer for the Department of  
4 Homeland Security. Mary Ellen.

5 Ms. Callahan: Thank you very much, sir,  
6 and great to see a lot of old friends. This is  
7 kind of like returning home, but also the end of an  
8 era, candidly. As we look to say goodbye to Lynn  
9 it is also great to see, by the way, Lisa and  
10 Charles, who I think are the only overlaps on  
11 DPIAC, but of course my former Deputy, John Kropf,  
12 it is also great to see you as well.

13 I think many of you know Lynn was my  
14 first special assistant when I was the Chief  
15 Privacy Officer, and I followed her career with  
16 absolute delight, both at PCLOB -- she took that  
17 brief stint to go into the private sector -- but  
18 candidly as the Secretary had said when he spoke  
19 about Lynn to the leadership, there was no one who  
20 could be the Chief Privacy Officer for this  
21 Administration other than Lynn Parker Dupree. And  
22 I have been really excited to be able to work with

1 her for the past 18 months again, so it has really  
2 been wonderful. And for that I did want to say  
3 hello to my privacy friends, but also to say best  
4 wishes to Lynn as she departs on her next new  
5 journey.

6 Thank you, Lynn. Great to see everybody,  
7 and go DPIAC.

8 Ms. Dupree: Thank you, Deputy Secretary,  
9 and Mary Ellen, for your kind words. As I have  
10 said before, the Privacy Office is only as  
11 successful as the leadership, and having you all in  
12 the leadership positions, understanding that  
13 privacy is part of the mission, has made all of the  
14 different, and I cannot thank you enough for all of  
15 your support during my tenure. So thank you both.

16 Ms. Callahan: Best wishes. Bye,  
17 everyone.

18 Mr. Bice: Good morning, again, and after  
19 that exciting start I will take a few minutes to go  
20 over and have a roll call, and then I will turn it  
21 over to our committee chairperson for opening  
22 remarks. So bear with me as I go through this roll

1 call. We will try to make this quick. A simple  
2 "here" or "present" would be fine.

3 Sharon Anolik.

4 [No response.]

5 Mr. Bice: Michael Fitzpatrick.

6 Mr. Fitzpatrick: Present.

7 Mr. Bice: Mark Francis.

8 Mr. Francis: Here.

9 Mr. Bice: Joseph Hewitt.

10 Mr. Hewitt: Here.

11 Mr. Bice: Sarah Knight.

12 Ms. Knight: Here.

13 Mr. Bice: John Kropf.

14 Mr. Kropf: Here.

15 Mr. Bice: Ade Odutola.

16 [No response.]

17 Mr. Bice: Chris Pahl.

18 Mr. Pahl: Here.

19 Mr. Bice: Charles Palmer.

20 Mr. Palmer: Here.

21 Mr. Bice: Harriet Pearson.

22 Ms. Pearson: Here.

1 Mr. Bice: Sasha Romanosky.

2 Mr. Romanosky: Here.

3 Mr. Bice: Cameron Russell.

4 Mr. Russell: Here.

5 Mr. Bice: Thomas Siu.

6 Mr. Siu: Present and accounted for.

7 Mr. Bice: Thank you. Lisa Sotto.

8 Ms. Sotto: I am here.

9 Mr. Bice: Good morning. Chris Teitzel.

10 Mr. Teitzel: Here.

11 Mr. Bice: Ray Thomas.

12 Mr. Thomas: Present.

13 Mr. Bice: And last but not least, Ron

14 Whitworth.

15 Mr. Whitworth: Here. Good morning.

16 Mr. Bice: Good morning, all, and thank

17 you again for joining us. If I missed you or if

18 you were unable hit that mute button, as I do most

19 times, feel free to drop that you are attending in

20 the chat and we will record that.

21 All right, and without further delay here

22 I am going to turn this over to Chairperson Lisa

1 Sotto. Good morning.

2 Ms. Sotto: Good morning. Thank you so  
3 much, Bill, and thank you all for joining us today.  
4 We welcome you to this meeting of the Data Privacy  
5 and Integrity Advisory Committee.

6 Before we begin I would like to thank  
7 Lynn so very, very much for her service to the  
8 Department. It has been a great pleasure working  
9 with you, Lynn, and we wish you so much luck going  
10 forward. I think from the bottom of our hearts,  
11 everybody on this Committee is with me in saying  
12 that. During your tenure in the Privacy Office you  
13 have accomplished so much and you have moved this  
14 office forward in tremendous ways. The Committee  
15 looks forward to having you come back and speak to  
16 the Committee in your new capacity, so hopefully  
17 you will join us to do that, just as Mary Ellen did  
18 today, which was so lovely to see her.

19 Some housekeeping matters before we hear  
20 from CPO Dupree. I would like to remind everybody  
21 to please mute your mics. Members of the public  
22 who would like to address the Committee during the

1 public comment portion may do so, and we ask that  
2 you please email [privacycommittee@hq.dhs.gov](mailto:privacycommittee@hq.dhs.gov), or if  
3 you would like to write it in the chat that is fine  
4 too and we will be checking the chat.

5           The purpose for today's meeting is to  
6 receive updates on the Privacy Office activities  
7 since our last public meeting, which was in April  
8 of 2022. And following the public meeting we will  
9 have an administrative session, so please stay with  
10 us if you are a Committee member for the  
11 administrative session.

12           I would like to now turn the program over  
13 to Chief Privacy Officer Lynn Parker Dupree who  
14 will address the Committee.

15           Ms. Dupree: Thank you very much. Good  
16 morning, everyone, and with today being my last day  
17 I just wanted to take this opportunity to say that  
18 it has been an honor and a privilege to serve as  
19 the Chief Privacy Officer and the Chief FOIA  
20 Officer for almost two years, and I am so grateful  
21 for the opportunity to have worked with so many  
22 hardworking, smart, dedicated public servants.

1                   And more than that, I also wanted to  
2    thank the DPIAC members for your service to the  
3    Department.  Since 2004, this Committee has  
4    provided critical advice, counsel, and  
5    recommendations on all sorts of issues, from  
6    programmatic, policy, operational, and  
7    administrative issues related to personally  
8    identifiable information, data integrity,  
9    transparency, and any privacy issue that impacts  
10   the Department's mission.  And this Committee's  
11   collective efforts have yielded great outcomes for  
12   the Department, and it is only possible through  
13   your commitment of time and effort, which is  
14   especially notable given your other professional  
15   responsibilities.

16                   So again, thank you for your continued  
17   commitment to Department's mission, and I do hope  
18   to have the opportunity to work with you all again  
19   in the future.

20                   So since our last meeting, the Privacy  
21   Office has been working hard to ensure that we can  
22   continue to turn to the DPIAC for advice on how to



1 confront the Department's privacy challenges. We  
2 have renewed the DPIAC's charter, and I want to  
3 congratulate our members on their reappointments.  
4 The Privacy Office is excited to continue their  
5 work with this Committee, and I am going to be  
6 following your work and your recommendations on how  
7 the Department can better protect privacy from  
8 afar.

9           You know, as we are acutely aware,  
10 safeguarding data and privacy is critical to  
11 protecting the public and the homeland, so again,  
12 thank you for volunteering your time and your  
13 expertise to help us continue this important work.

14           And then during today's meeting I am  
15 going to update you all on a few key areas of the  
16 Privacy Office's accomplishments in 2022, and share  
17 some of the goals for continued progress in 2023.  
18 I would like to begin with one of our most forward-  
19 leaning priorities, which is to embed privacy in  
20 the Department's technological architecture. And  
21 really, this initiative is designed to be a force  
22 multiplier for the work that we already do to

1 identify and mitigate privacy risks during the  
2 development of programs. And the vision is to have  
3 the Privacy Office play a role in identifying,  
4 promoting, and implementing privacy-enhancing  
5 technologies.

6           So in 2023, we will continue to work in  
7 partnership with the private sector on privacy-  
8 enhancing technologies through the Science and  
9 Technology Directorate's Silicon Valley Innovation  
10 Project. We will also continue to build on the  
11 success of our 2022 Privacy-Enhancing Technologies  
12 for the Homeland Security Enterprise workshop, that  
13 we co-hosted with the S&T Center for Accelerating  
14 Operational Efficiency. And what that workshop did  
15 was improve awareness of promising research  
16 methodologies for privacy-enhancing technologies  
17 and allow academics to develop an understanding of  
18 DHS programs and our specific privacy challenges,  
19 and it connected researchers with available support  
20 to translate that research that they are doing into  
21 actual operational practice.

22           And so we plan to advance this work

1 through additional workshops with the center in the  
2 future and to continue to identify use cases that  
3 might be solved by privacy-enhancing technologies  
4 and inform our DHS officials internally about how  
5 this technology might be used in their programs and  
6 in their systems.

7 We will also continue to focus on the  
8 Department's use of commercially available data.  
9 As many of you may recall, in 2022, we tasked the  
10 Committee with providing recommendations on a  
11 governance structure for the Department's use of  
12 commercial data. We have also been working  
13 internally to understand the Department's  
14 operational, legal, and privacy needs with respect  
15 to commercial data.

16 So the Privacy Office will synthesize the  
17 DPIAC's recommendations and combine that with the  
18 perspective we have already gathered to develop a  
19 framework that ensure the Department can use this  
20 data to achieve its mission while meeting legal  
21 requirements and uniform privacy safeguards.

22 Finally, I am very excited to share that

1 we have made significant progress on an initiative  
2 to provide our components with a tool that they can  
3 use to manage their privacy programs and improve  
4 compliance. Specifically, the Privacy Office  
5 collaborated very closely with our Office of the  
6 Chief Information Officer and our component privacy  
7 officers to modify the Privacy Office's internal  
8 compliance tracking tool, which is called PRIV-  
9 CATS. And the vision behind the modifications to  
10 PRIV-CATS was really to turn that tool into a  
11 dynamic documentation collaboration platform.

12 And so what the tool will do now is  
13 improve the ability to track compliance  
14 documentation throughout our entire process, from  
15 component to headquarters. It will allow us to  
16 identify areas for increased efficiency. It will  
17 help us ensure consistency in our approach to  
18 privacy risk and mitigation across the Department,  
19 and hopefully help us identify best practices. The  
20 changes are also designed to help us reduce  
21 reliance on email and really reduce the  
22 administrative burden that is associated with

1 manual tracking.

2           And so throughout 2022, we laid the  
3 groundwork for this expansion. We spent a  
4 significant amount of time gathering input from our  
5 component Privacy Offices to understand their needs  
6 and their specific technical requirements, to talk  
7 about how they also might be able to use PRIV-CATS  
8 to manage their internal programs. We also  
9 completed user acceptance testing to gather  
10 valuable feedback on what works well and what  
11 improvements could be made to PRIV-CATS, and we  
12 expect to launch the revised version of PRIV-CATS,  
13 which we are calling PRIV-CATS 2.0, for component  
14 use this year.

15           And again, to the DPIAC, thank you for  
16 sharing your time, your effort, your expertise with  
17 the Department. It is critical to protecting the  
18 nation's homeland and beyond.

19           And now I will turn it over to Ross  
20 Maciejewski, who can provide you with a little more  
21 detail about the workshop we did with the Center  
22 for Accelerating Operational Efficiency and the

1 status of requests for proposal that came out of  
2 that work. Thank you.

3 Mr. Maciejewski: Great. Thank you so  
4 much, Lynn. My pleasure to be here. I am Ross  
5 Maciejewski. I am director of one of the ten  
6 Department of Homeland Security Centers of  
7 Excellence, the Center for Accelerating Operational  
8 Efficiency. It was my pleasure this summer to be  
9 able to work with the Privacy Office and DHS to  
10 create a workshop for bringing together academics  
11 and practitioners from the Department of Homeland  
12 Security, working on privacy-enhancing  
13 technologies.

14 Our workshop was held on June 21, 2022,  
15 in the Washington, D.C., facility for Arizona State  
16 University, and the idea was to bring together  
17 people in the Department of Homeland Security that  
18 had needs for privacy-enhancing technologies as  
19 well as academics who are working on building these  
20 out and try to think about how we can better  
21 integrate these two communities together.

22 For those that do not know, privacy-

1 enhancing technologies, or PETs, promise the  
2 ability to control the sharing and use of sensitive  
3 information while minimizing the risk of  
4 unauthorized use. These technologies have been  
5 under development by researchers for nearly four  
6 decades, but have been slow to migrate from the  
7 research lab into operational use. This workshop  
8 was designed to help speed the pace of change by  
9 engaging researchers and practitioners in a joint  
10 endeavor to solve the hard problems that enable us  
11 to solve the practical problems so we can put new  
12 technologies into practice while still keeping risk  
13 levels low.

14           And this workshop could not have advanced  
15 without the strong support from the Department of  
16 Homeland Security's Privacy Office, and I really  
17 need to thank Simson Garfinkel and Lynn Parker  
18 Dupree for all the help and support they gave me.  
19 I am not a privacy expert. I am a data science  
20 expert. I work on data visualization, computer  
21 graphics. I run this broad center in conjunction  
22 with DHS Office of University Programs, working on

1 operations research, data science, economic  
2 analysis, and homeland security risk science.  
3 Privacy falls under our umbrella, so leading up the  
4 team with them was a really great opportunity for  
5 our center.

6           So what are PETs? This term emerged in  
7 2003, and they originally covered a broad range of  
8 functional requirements, from anonymity,  
9 linkability, undetectability, unobservability,  
10 pseudonymity, and identity management. Examples  
11 include Pretty Good Privacy, Transport Layer  
12 Security, and the Onion Router. And these are  
13 increasingly applied to technology for privacy-  
14 preserving data publishing and privacy-preserving  
15 data analysis.

16           Some of the key terms you may have heard  
17 of would be differential privacy, that was used to  
18 publish aggregate statistical data while limiting  
19 privacy laws to individuals. For example, the 2020  
20 Census uses differential privacy to aggregate the  
21 statistical data. There are things like secure  
22 multiparty computation, where you are going to



1 learn the results by computation without revealing  
2 inputs to other. For example, find the age of  
3 everyone in a room without revealing anyone's age  
4 to anyone else.

5           There is homomorphic encryption, so  
6 performing operations on encrypted data; private  
7 set intersections, such as find common entries  
8 between two datasets without revealing either; and  
9 private search, perform a search on a database  
10 without revealing search terms or retrieved  
11 records.

12           So this idea of having a privacy-  
13 enhancing technologies symposium for the homeland  
14 security enterprise began to originate in November  
15 of 2017, well before my interactions with the  
16 Privacy Office. There was a workshop on multiparty  
17 computing and the U.S. Census Bureau, and the  
18 Census Bureau knew that it wanted to use the  
19 technology but it was not sure now. So there was a  
20 day of presentations about what was available to  
21 academia and industry, and there was a JASON report  
22 compiled in November of 2020, about secure

1 computation for business data.

2           And there were two slides from Deloitte's  
3 presentation, talking about the peak of inflated  
4 expectation and the slope of enlightenment and how  
5 we are trying to move towards this slope of  
6 enlightenment with privacy-enhancing technologies  
7 and getting these out into the field for getting  
8 real-term use.

9           And so in January 2022, the Privacy  
10 Office had this idea to have a workshop in which  
11 people from the Department of Homeland Security  
12 will take about their algorithmic needs for privacy  
13 and then we're going to get researchers from the  
14 privacy community to talk about their bag of  
15 solutions.

16           So the core questions the Privacy Office  
17 began to ask is, well, how can we fund this? What  
18 is the vending? What is the format? They explored  
19 partnership with other Federal agencies. There  
20 were meetings between DHS, CPO, and OSTP, and the  
21 Chief Privacy Office agreed to fund this.

22           After they figured out those sorts of

1 items they began looking around to see what venues  
2 and avenues might make the most sense, and this is  
3 where the Department of Homeland Security Office of  
4 University came into play and started connecting  
5 them with the relevant components that the Office  
6 of University Programs also funds.

7           And the goal of the workshop was to teach  
8 DHS leaders and program managers about the  
9 opportunities offered by PETs, and this is a  
10 fundamental new way of thinking about data  
11 within26s within the government. PETs do not fit  
12 well within the current policy IT systems,  
13 training, skills, et cetera, and we wanted to  
14 expose privacy-enhancing technology researchers to  
15 the needs of government, because researchers may  
16 not be talking to their partners in the Federal  
17 Government or understanding the constraints in  
18 those agencies. And we needed to explain to PETs  
19 researchers the messiness of government data  
20 practices, and most PETs cannot be used in a  
21 government setting without a lot of adaptation. So  
22 thinking about how we can bring these communities

1 together to bridge these challenges.

2           And so in February of 2022, DHS developed  
3 a task order for the Center of Excellence that I  
4 run, the Center for Accelerating Operational  
5 Efficiency. We provided administrative support,  
6 venue, food, travel support for invited speakers,  
7 and we decided to go crazy and put this on in July.  
8 So that gave us a little less than six months to be  
9 able to put together a workshop, and to do this we  
10 needed to form a review committee. We asked for  
11 use cases from our government partners, we got  
12 academics from across the world, and we put out two  
13 calls for participation. Our first call was a call  
14 for use cases from government partners, and our  
15 second call was on white papers from PETs  
16 researchers across the United States.

17           And so in March 2022, working with the  
18 Chief Privacy Office and Simson Garfinkel,  
19 specifically, DHS privacy officers solicited use  
20 cases and problem statements from DHS components.  
21 We worked with USCIS, Coast Guard, CBP, CISA, FEMA,  
22 FLETC, ICE, Secret Service, TSA, and we gave them

1 this form, saying, okay, give us a title, your  
2 component, a short description of your privacy-  
3 enhancing technology needs, tell us how it is done  
4 today, what are the risks, and is there any funding  
5 currently going on in your organization with this.

6 We developed this template so they knew  
7 what to submit, and then internally, at DHS, they  
8 collected and edited the use cases, and critically,  
9 they got support from the components they could  
10 publicly release these. All of these use cases are  
11 found at this website, on our PETS4HSE.org, and we  
12 wound up with 11 use cases being able to be  
13 publicly released from OCHIO, CISA, ICE, OBIM, and  
14 USCIS. And at the end of this slide deck I have  
15 all the use cases listed as well for when they  
16 share this slide deck.

17 So the main lessons we learned in  
18 soliciting these were our template should have had  
19 maybe better and more specific instructions, and  
20 perhaps we should have used consistent terminology,  
21 not use cases and problem statements, where we  
22 switch between the two words, so trying to get a

1 little bit better at this.

2           And then some components had difficulty  
3 coming up with uses cases. This was sort of still  
4 a foreign concept to them in terms of using some  
5 newer privacy-enhancing technologies, and some  
6 components did not want use cases public, even  
7 though they were deemed unclassified.

8           So we also had to receive more uses. We  
9 would have gotten more use cases from this if we  
10 would have been able to put in more effort, but  
11 again, our time period was relatively short. We  
12 needed one-on-one meetings to explain what privacy-  
13 enhancing technologies were in detail. Often this  
14 required discussion to develop the use cases in  
15 collaboration with the component, and needed to  
16 have a lot of focus up front on making the use  
17 cases releasable.

18           Moving forward, use cases can inspire  
19 both developers and other potential users, and it  
20 would be useful to have a catalog of potential uses  
21 of PETs within the government to be able to help  
22 inspire researchers in this area.

1           So that is how we engage with the  
2 government side of the house, was getting these use  
3 cases. On the academic side of the house we engage  
4 PET researchers by creating a call for white papers  
5 between the Chief Data Officer Directorate,  
6 Privacy, and ASU. We created this call for white  
7 papers and posted it to a conference management  
8 system called EasyChair. This call was promoted by  
9 email, Twitter, and networks of academics working  
10 in the privacy-enhancing technology field.

11           The main lessons learned here, we had a  
12 little hiccup in our acronyms, using PETS-4-HSE.  
13 And the other big thing was we needed to have the  
14 conference site ready to go early and build the  
15 program committee early. And again, remember, we  
16 were doing this all within six months, so overall  
17 if we were to roll this out again given a little  
18 bit more lead time would perhaps improve the flow  
19 of things a little bit better.

20           But overall we were really thrilled with  
21 the results. We had 21 submissions. Given that we  
22 just sort of had a six-week submission time period

1 that was really exciting. We accepted over half  
2 the submissions, so we wound up with 11 white  
3 papers to be presented at the workshop. I provided  
4 the list of white papers, but again, you can go to  
5 PETS4HSE.org and you could actually download all of  
6 the white papers from the workshop as well.

7           And what was neat is that there was an  
8 extraordinarily broad range of privacy-enhancing  
9 technologies. Researchers were focused on security  
10 multiparty computation, homomorphic encryption,  
11 federated learning, the human computer interaction  
12 side of privacy. These might all be useful for DHS  
13 components. The components also could benefit from  
14 simply technologies too. And this is one of the  
15 first efforts to bring together researchers and  
16 potential users of this technology.

17           And so now we want to think about what  
18 are the structural barriers to researchers seeking  
19 out potential users, and there are mechanisms that  
20 exist for academic to partner with the government,  
21 so why aren't they being used?

22           And this led to sort of the next



1 question. Since we have these centers of  
2 excellence under the Department of Homeland  
3 Security Office of University Programs, why can't  
4 we start using these mechanisms to help better  
5 create this academic-government partnership? And  
6 so working with the Office of University Programs,  
7 my center of excellence developed a call for  
8 proposals for this coming year to try to get  
9 academics to propose research projects on privacy-  
10 enhancing technologies.

11 And the way these calls for proposal work  
12 under these centers of excellence is we put out the  
13 call, researchers respond to the call, the  
14 proposals undergo academic review, all of those  
15 that pass the academic review board then go to our  
16 DHS components to see if anybody wants to champion  
17 that or serve as the end user for helping guide  
18 these technologies to get them delivered into  
19 Department of Homeland Security.

20 And so all of this was designed to start  
21 thinking about how can we bring privacy into the  
22 forefront of system design, how can we bring

1 privacy into the forefront of procurement, can we  
2 specify functionality without a specific approach  
3 or vendor, how do we validate solutions, how do we  
4 avoid vendor lock-in. Each company has its own  
5 technology and as agencies procure different  
6 technologies we want to move forward leaning with  
7 respect to privacy.

8           And there is also this general lack of  
9 awareness about privacy-enhancing technologies. So  
10 this workshop and the RFP were all designed to sort  
11 of help bring privacy to the forefront, help  
12 provide some mechanisms for improving this general  
13 lack of awareness.

14           So after we developed this request for  
15 proposal, remember, the workshop was in July, we  
16 had all these nice reports from the workshop, all  
17 these nice white papers, all of the nice use cases.  
18 We developed a call for proposals in August. The  
19 request for proposals was due in October. Eight  
20 proposals were submitted, and they underwent a two-  
21 phase review process, as I described.

22           And I am happy to report that three

1 proposals were selected and awards were announced.

2 I am sorry, I had to type on this slide and put

3 four, but three proposals were selected, awards

4 were announced on January 27th. So the three

5 proposals, moving forward, are these three:

6 "Cerberus: Guarding Sensitive Data with Trigenous

7 Secure Computations," "Privacy-Preserving Analytics

8 for Non-IID data," and "A Federated Query Optimizer

9 for Privacy-Preserving Analytics and Machine

10 Learning."

11 So we are really excited to get these

12 kicked off. They will be starting in February, and

13 we have a variety of different components working

14 with these researchers. These projects come from

15 Notre Dame, University of Illinois, and Arizona

16 State University.

17 In conjunction with this, to try to help

18 bring privacy-enhancing technologies to the

19 forefront, we also worked with the Department of

20 Homeland Security and the Privacy Office to develop

21 a seminar series on challenges and opportunities

22 for privacy-enhancing technologies in the homeland

1 security enterprise, and here we got leading  
2 academic luminaries from across the country to talk  
3 about their research and spend an hour lunch-and-  
4 learn at DHS, giving updates on interesting  
5 technologies and things they see happening at the  
6 forefront of privacy-enhancing technologies. To  
7 kick us off we had Dr. Raphail Ostrovsky, who is an  
8 expert in cryptography, followed by Dr. Jean Camp  
9 at the University of Indiana, who is more on the  
10 user-centric side of privacy. We had Steve Lu at  
11 Stealth Software Technologies. And then coming up  
12 we have Dr. Alysa Frik joining us.

13           And all of this material in this  
14 presentation is based upon work by our Department  
15 of Homeland Security grants award. These and  
16 conclusions contained in this document are those of  
17 the authors and should not be interpreted as  
18 representing official policies.

19           And again, I just wanted to really give  
20 my thanks to Simson Garfinkel and Lynn Parker  
21 Dupree. It was really exciting for me to be able  
22 to work with the Privacy Office. They were great

1 partners in all of this, and I think we put  
2 together a really nice workshop. I think the RFP  
3 and upcoming proposals are going to start showing  
4 this really unique intersection for academic and  
5 government partnership, and I can't wait to see  
6 what else we are able to do with the Privacy Office  
7 in the coming years.

8 With that I can turn it over for any  
9 questions or move on with the meeting. Thank you.

10 Ms. Sotto: Thank you so much, Ross.  
11 That was really helpful. We've been hearing so  
12 much about PETs, and it's a terrific acronym. But  
13 I think there is certainly confusion -- can you all  
14 hear me okay?

15 If you're not speaking -- okay, I think  
16 somebody just put us on mute.

17 Anyway, we really appreciate your  
18 presentation. There really has been just, I think,  
19 there's a swirl around PETs, but some confusion as  
20 to what it really is, and this is very helpful, and  
21 it's, of course, helpful to get input from so much  
22 of academia, and what a terrific boon to the

1 Department. So thank you very, very much for that.

2 Let me open it up to DPIAC members for  
3 questions. Do we have any questions? If you do,  
4 just please take yourself off mute and you can just  
5 chime right in.

6 [No response.]

7 Ms. Sotto: Ross, I think you've stunned  
8 us into silence, so thank you so much. I think  
9 we're going to get the slides after the meeting.  
10 We may, of course, circle back to you as we ponder  
11 what you've just discussed, and we very much  
12 appreciate it. Thank you.

13 Mr. Maciejewski: Of course. Thank you  
14 so much for inviting me, and if anybody has  
15 questions please do feel free to email me. I am  
16 the only Ross Maciejewski on Google. So thank you.

17 Ms. Sotto: Great. All right. So let's  
18 move on. We are now going to turn to an update on  
19 our commercial data tasking, so Chris Teitzel, I  
20 would like to turn it over to you. Chris is the  
21 Chair of the Technology Subcommittee of the DPIAC,  
22 and he is going to update us on the subcommittee's

1 activities related to this tasking. Thank you,  
2 Chris.

3 Mr. Teitzel: Thank you, Lisa. And  
4 before I get started I want to echo all the  
5 comments said this morning. Ms. Parker Dupree,  
6 your efforts and work in the Department, and  
7 particularly with the DPIAC, have been  
8 transformative, and we wish you nothing but the  
9 best in your future.

10 So going back to our previous annual  
11 meeting, we were tasked with looking at commercial  
12 data. Now commercial data within the DPIAC has  
13 been core to what we have done all the way back to  
14 the outset. In 2005, the Committee issued a report  
15 around commercial data to reduce false positives in  
16 the screening programs. It made 13 recommendations  
17 including that commercial data only be used when  
18 necessary to satisfy and define purpose, that the  
19 minimization principle is used when using data, and  
20 that access to that data is tightly controlled.

21 A subsequent report was released in 2006  
22 around the use of commercial data, and they made

1 additional recommendations to supplement the 2005  
2 report. But obviously since 2005, 2006, commercial  
3 data and the use of commercial data has changed  
4 greatly. And so, Ms. Parker Dupree, in our  
5 previous meeting, asked the DPIAC with providing  
6 our views and recommendations on a governance  
7 policy and framework related to the use of  
8 commercial data in Federal programs.

9           This was taken back to the subcommittees.  
10 It was decided that the Policy Subcommittee would  
11 take lead on this, as it is a policy-related  
12 tasking. However, as we all can imagine, there is  
13 quite a bit of technology that goes into the  
14 collection, use, and dissemination of data within  
15 the Federal programs, and so the Technology  
16 Subcommittee was asked to provide a few  
17 participants as well, to be represented as well in  
18 this tasking.

19           We were able to get together and have a  
20 few very productive meetings. There are a lot of  
21 great points and discussions already coming up in  
22 those meetings, and we are working with the



1 Department and different areas of the Department to  
2 gather information, either on current methods or on  
3 previous working directives and various work that  
4 is already being done, as well as a whole host of -  
5 - and I have got a list here -- a whole host of  
6 questions and areas of concern that the Committee  
7 wants to take a look at as part of this tasking.

8           With the reformation of the DPIAC over  
9 the course of 2022, we are excited to get back into  
10 that, and we are scheduling new meetings for 2023  
11 in order to continue on with this tasking. And so  
12 there is nothing of essence to provide right now,  
13 but there is quite a bit of work going on. And in  
14 my opinion, this is going to be one of the more  
15 involved and important taskings that we have taken  
16 on in some time because the use of commercial data  
17 within not only the Department but within all  
18 Federal programs is a very sensitive issue and  
19 something that we need to not take lightly.

20           The committees are going to be getting  
21 together likely within the next few weeks and  
22 working on what our next steps are and where we

1 will be going, and I look forward to providing a  
2 further update and hopefully some working papers in  
3 the near future.

4 And with that I will open it up for  
5 questions or toss it back to you, Lisa.

6 Ms. Sotto: Thank you. I was going to do  
7 the same. So please, if we have any questions from  
8 Committee members, now is your chance.

9 [No response.]

10 Ms. Sotto: I'll just, Chris, add to your  
11 remarks. This is such an important issue, one that  
12 is causing huge swirl, so the work that you are  
13 doing is terrific and important, so thank you very  
14 much. And I know we have a lot to do ahead on this  
15 topic.

16 And I just want to note, Mason Clutter,  
17 who will be taking over as the acting DPO, we are  
18 so excited to welcome you to our ranks, Mason, and  
19 really delighted to have you ushering us through  
20 for this continued initiative and the others that  
21 we are going to be doing. So thank you for  
22 stepping into the role.

1 Ms. Clutter: Thank you. I am looking  
2 forward to it. I look forward to working with you  
3 and the DPIAC.

4 Ms. Sotto: Thank you. And we are here  
5 for you. I just want to make that clear. We are  
6 available. We are delighted to assist, so please  
7 call on us. We have got a lot of terrific experts  
8 on the Committee, so use us. We are here.

9 Ms. Clutter: Absolutely. Thank you.

10 Ms. Sotto: Terrific. All right.

11 So let me turn to the public comment  
12 period, and I am checking the chat and I have not  
13 seen any public comments. And there were no  
14 preregistered individuals who wanted to comment.  
15 So we will open up the floor to any members of the  
16 public who would like to speak. I just remind you  
17 to keep your remarks to under three minutes, as  
18 described in the Federal Register notice.

19 If you are joining by phone, you can  
20 unmute yourself by pressing \*6.

21 So let me open it up now. Do we have any  
22 comments from members of the public? We will give

1 it a few minutes.

2 [No response.]

3 Ms. Sotto: All right. Going once, going  
4 twice. Okay.

5 Bill, can I close things out?

6 Mr. Bice: Yes. This will conclude what  
7 we have scheduled for our agenda, so the public  
8 meeting can be adjourned, ma'am, yes. Thanks.

9 Ms. Sotto: Okay. Well then this  
10 formally concludes our public comment portion. If  
11 you would like to submit written comments please do  
12 so by emailing them to [privacycommittee@hq.dhs.gov](mailto:privacycommittee@hq.dhs.gov),  
13 and if you could please do so by February 13, 2023,  
14 we would appreciate it. And I just want to also  
15 note that because the DPIAC operates under the  
16 provisions of the Federal Advisory Committee Act,  
17 all written comments will be treated as public  
18 documents and will be made available for public  
19 inspection.

20 So with that, many, many thanks to Chief  
21 Privacy Office Lynn Parker Dupree. Lynn, thank you  
22 so, so much for your service. We really look

1 forward to hearing about your next journey, and  
2 cannot wait to have you back in whatever capacity.  
3 So thank you, thank you, thank you.

4 Thank you also to Committee members and  
5 to members of the public who participated in  
6 today's meeting, and thank you to members of  
7 Privacy Office who also joined us, and to Bill.  
8 Very much appreciated.

9 This concludes today's public meeting.  
10 We are grateful for your interest, and we encourage  
11 you to please follow the Committee's work by  
12 checking our Web page, which is, by the way, chock  
13 full of good privacy materials. So hopefully  
14 useful.

15 The minutes of today's meeting will be  
16 posted there in the near future, and I would like  
17 to now turn it over to Bill to begin our  
18 administrative session.

19 (Whereupon, at 9:45 a.m., the open  
20 session was adjourned.)  
21  
22

**WORD INDEX**

**< 0 >**

**0655** 1:19

**< 1 >**

**10** 2:13  
**11** 28:12 31:2  
**13** 2:15 38:16 43:13  
**14** 2:19  
**18** 10:1

**< 2 >**

**2.0** 20:13  
**20** 3:3  
**2003** 23:7  
**2004** 15:3  
**2005** 38:14 39:1, 2  
**2006** 38:21 39:2  
**2017** 24:15  
**2020** 23:19 24:22  
**2022** 14:8 16:16 17:11  
18:9 20:2 21:14 25:9  
27:2, 17 40:9  
**2023** 1:12 2:19 16:17  
17:6 40:10 43:13  
**20598-0655** 1:20  
**21** 21:14 30:21  
**2701** 1:19  
**27th** 34:4

**< 3 >**

**31** 1:12  
**38** 3:8

**< 4 >**

**4** 2:3, 7  
**42** 3:11  
**43** 3:12

**< 6 >**

**6** 42:20

**< 9 >**

**9:00** 1:11 4:3  
**9:45** 44:19

**< A >**

**a.m** 1:11 44:19  
**ability** 19:13 22:2  
**able** 9:22 20:7 21:9  
27:9 28:12 29:10, 21  
35:21 36:6 39:19  
**absolute** 9:16  
**Absolutely** 42:9  
**academia** 24:21 36:22  
**academic** 30:3 31:20  
32:14, 15 35:2 36:4  
**academic-government**  
32:5

**academics** 17:17 21:10,  
19 27:12 30:9 32:9  
**Accelerating** 3:5 17:13  
20:22 21:7 27:4  
**acceptance** 20:9  
**accepted** 31:1  
**access** 38:20  
**accomplished** 13:13  
**accomplishments** 16:16  
**accounted** 12:6  
**achieve** 18:20  
**acronym** 36:12  
**acronyms** 30:12  
**Act** 43:16  
**acting** 8:2 41:17  
**ACTIVITIES** 2:18 14:6  
38:1  
**actual** 17:21  
**acutely** 16:9  
**adaptation** 26:21  
**add** 41:10  
**additional** 18:1 39:1  
**address** 13:22 14:14  
**Ade** 11:15  
**adjourned** 43:8 44:20  
**ADJOURNMENT** 3:12  
**Administration** 7:2, 8, 10,  
12 9:21  
**administrative** 5:15  
14:9, 11 15:7 19:22  
27:5 44:18  
**advance** 17:22  
**advanced** 22:14  
**advice** 15:4, 22  
**ADVISORY** 1:3 2:17  
3:10 4:5 13:5 43:16  
**afar** 16:8  
**age** 24:2, 3  
**agencies** 25:19 26:18  
33:5  
**AGENDA** 2:2 3:2 4:12  
43:7  
**aggregate** 23:18, 20  
**ago** 8:19  
**agreed** 8:22 25:21  
**agreeing** 8:1  
**ahead** 41:14  
**algorithmic** 25:12  
**allow** 17:17 19:15  
**Alternate** 2:4  
**Alysa** 35:12  
**America** 6:6 7:3  
**amount** 7:15 20:4  
**analysis** 23:2, 15  
**Analytics** 34:7, 9  
**announced** 34:1, 4  
**annual** 38:10  
**Anolik** 11:3  
**anonymity** 23:8  
**anybody** 32:16 37:14

**anyone's** 24:3  
**Anyway** 36:17  
**apologize** 5:12  
**applied** 23:13  
**appreciate** 6:1 7:1  
36:17 37:12 43:14  
**appreciated** 44:8  
**approach** 19:17 33:2  
**April** 14:7  
**architecture** 16:20  
**area** 29:22  
**areas** 16:15 19:16 40:1,  
6  
**Arizona** 21:15 34:15  
**articulate** 6:10  
**asked** 27:10 39:5, 16  
**assist** 42:6  
**assistant** 9:14  
**associated** 19:22  
**ASU** 30:6  
**attending** 12:19  
**August** 33:18  
**authors** 35:17  
**available** 17:19 18:8  
24:20 42:6 43:18  
**Ave** 1:19  
**avenues** 26:2  
**avoid** 33:4  
**award** 35:15  
**awards** 34:1, 3  
**aware** 16:9  
**awareness** 17:15 33:9, 13

**< B >**

**back** 7:16 13:15 37:10  
38:10, 13 39:9 40:9  
41:5 44:2  
**bag** 25:14  
**barriers** 31:18  
**based** 35:14  
**bear** 10:22  
**began** 24:14 25:17 26:1  
**beginning** 5:1  
**believe** 4:15  
**benefit** 31:13  
**best** 10:3, 16 19:19 38:9  
**better** 16:7 21:20 28:19  
29:1 30:19 32:4  
**beyond** 20:18  
**Bice** 2:4, 14 4:2 10:18  
11:5, 7, 9, 11, 13, 15, 17,  
19, 21 12:1, 3, 5, 7, 9, 11,  
13, 16 43:6  
**big** 6:14 30:13  
**Bill** 2:4, 14 13:3 43:5  
44:7, 17  
**bit** 29:1 30:18, 19  
39:13 40:13  
**blast** 4:19  
**board** 32:15

**boon** 36:22  
**bottom** 13:10  
**bridge** 27:1  
**brief** 9:17  
**bring** 21:16 26:22  
31:15 32:21, 22 33:11  
34:18  
**bringing** 21:10  
**broad** 22:21 23:7 31:8  
**broadly** 6:5  
**brought** 7:16  
**build** 17:10 30:14  
**building** 21:19  
**burden** 19:22  
**Bureau** 24:17, 18  
**business** 25:1  
**button** 12:18  
**Bye** 10:16

**< C >**

**CALL** 2:3, 13 8:4  
10:20 11:1 27:13, 15  
30:4, 6, 8 32:7, 13 33:18  
42:7  
**Callahan** 2:8 4:18, 19  
5:8, 18 8:19 9:5 10:16  
**called** 4:5 19:8 30:8  
**calling** 20:13  
**calls** 27:13 32:11  
**camera** 4:10  
**Cameron** 12:3  
**Camp** 35:8  
**candidly** 9:8, 18  
**capacity** 13:16 44:2  
**career** 9:15  
**cases** 18:2 27:11, 14, 20  
28:8, 10, 12, 15, 21 29:3,  
6, 9, 14, 17, 18 30:3  
33:17  
**catalog** 29:20  
**CATS** 19:9  
**causing** 41:12  
**CBP** 27:21  
**Census** 23:20 24:17, 18  
**Center** 3:4, 6 17:13  
18:1 20:21 21:7 22:21  
23:5 27:3, 4 32:7  
**Centers** 21:6 32:1, 12  
**Cerberus** 34:6  
**certainly** 6:6 36:13  
**cetera** 26:13  
**Chair** 3:9 37:21  
**CHAIRPERSON** 2:15,  
16 10:21 12:22  
**challenges** 7:15 16:1  
17:18 27:1 34:21  
**champion** 32:16  
**chance** 41:8  
**change** 22:8  
**changed** 5:16 39:3

**changes** 19:20  
**chapter** 6:7 7:21  
**Charles** 9:10 11:19  
**charter** 16:2  
**chat** 12:20 14:3, 4 42:12  
**checking** 14:4 42:12 44:12  
**Chief** 2:8, 20 4:20 8:2, 20, 21 9:3, 14, 20 14:13, 19 19:6 25:21 27:18 30:5 43:20  
**chime** 37:5  
**chock** 44:12  
**Chris** 3:9 11:17 12:9 37:19, 20 38:2 41:10  
**circle** 37:10  
**CISA** 27:21 28:13  
**clear** 42:5  
**close** 43:5  
**closely** 19:5  
**CLOSING** 3:12  
**Clutter** 8:1 41:16 42:1, 9  
**Coast** 6:13 8:4 27:21  
**co-hosted** 17:13  
**collaborated** 19:5  
**collaboration** 19:11 29:15  
**collected** 28:8  
**collection** 39:14  
**collective** 15:11  
**combine** 18:17  
**come** 8:20 13:15 34:14  
**coming** 29:3 32:8 35:11 36:7 39:21  
**commandant** 6:13  
**comment** 4:11 14:1 42:11, 14 43:10  
**comments** 6:2, 10 7:18 38:5 42:13, 22 43:11, 17  
**COMMERCIAL** 3:8 18:12, 15 37:19 38:11, 12, 15, 17, 22 39:2, 3, 8 40:16  
**commercially** 18:8  
**commitment** 15:13, 17  
**COMMITTEE** 1:4 2:17 3:10 4:5, 6 10:21 13:5, 11, 14, 16, 22 14:10, 14 15:3 16:5 18:10 27:10 30:15 38:14 40:6 41:8 42:8 43:16 44:4  
**committees** 40:20  
**Committee's** 15:10 44:11  
**common** 24:7  
**communities** 21:21 26:22  
**community** 25:14  
**company** 33:4  
**compiled** 24:22

**completed** 20:9  
**compliance** 19:4, 8, 13  
**component** 6:12, 14 19:6, 15 20:5, 13 28:2 29:15  
**components** 19:2 26:5 27:20 28:9 29:2, 6 31:13 32:16 34:13  
**computation** 23:22 24:1 25:1 31:10  
**Computations** 34:7  
**computer** 22:20 31:11  
**computing** 24:17  
**concept** 29:4  
**concern** 40:6  
**concerned** 8:14  
**conclude** 43:6  
**concludes** 43:10 44:9  
**conclusions** 35:16  
**condition** 7:16  
**conference** 30:7, 14  
**confront** 16:1  
**confusion** 36:13, 19  
**congratulate** 16:3  
**conjunction** 22:21 34:17  
**connected** 17:19  
**connecting** 26:4  
**consistency** 19:17  
**consistent** 28:20  
**constraints** 26:17  
**contained** 35:16  
**CONTENTS** 2:1 3:1  
**continue** 8:10 15:22 16:4, 13 17:6, 10 18:2, 7 40:11  
**continued** 3:1 15:16 16:17 41:20  
**contribution** 7:4  
**contributions** 7:20  
**control** 22:2  
**controlled** 38:20  
**core** 25:16 38:13  
**counsel** 15:4  
**country** 35:2  
**course** 9:11 36:21 37:10, 13 40:9  
**covered** 23:7  
**CPO** 13:20 25:20  
**crazy** 27:7  
**create** 21:10 32:5  
**created** 30:6  
**creating** 30:4  
**critical** 15:4 16:10 20:17  
**critically** 28:8  
**cryptography** 35:8  
**current** 26:12 40:2  
**currently** 28:5  
**< D >**

**D.C** 21:15  
**Dame** 34:15  
**DATA** 1:3 2:16 3:8, 10 4:4 13:4 15:8 16:10 18:8, 12, 15, 20 22:19, 20 23:1, 14, 15, 18, 21 24:6 25:1 26:10, 19 30:5 34:6, 8 37:19 38:12, 15, 17, 19, 20, 22 39:3, 8, 14 40:16  
**database** 24:9  
**datasets** 24:8  
**day** 7:18 8:6 14:16 24:20  
**DC** 1:20  
**decades** 22:6  
**decided** 27:7 39:10  
**decisions** 8:18  
**deck** 28:14, 16  
**dedicated** 14:22  
**deemed** 29:7  
**define** 38:18  
**delay** 12:21  
**delight** 9:16  
**delighted** 41:19 42:6  
**delivered** 32:18  
**Deloitte's** 25:2  
**DEPARTMENT** 1:1, 18 2:5, 10, 11, 21 3:6 4:21 6:5, 21 7:3, 5 8:18, 21 9:3 13:8 15:3, 12 16:7 18:19 19:18 20:17 21:6, 11, 17 22:15 25:11 26:3 32:2, 19 34:19 35:14 37:1 38:6 40:1, 17  
**Department's** 15:10, 17 16:1, 20 18:8, 11, 13  
**departs** 10:4  
**Deputy** 2:9, 11 4:20 6:21 8:21 9:11 10:8  
**described** 33:21 42:18  
**description** 28:2  
**design** 32:22  
**Designated** 2:4  
**designed** 16:21 19:20 22:8 32:20 33:10  
**detail** 20:21 29:13  
**develop** 17:17 18:18 29:14 34:20  
**developed** 27:2 28:6 32:7 33:14, 18  
**developers** 29:19  
**development** 17:2 22:5  
**devil** 5:5  
**DHS** 6:5, 12 7:9 8:5 17:18 18:4 21:9 22:22 25:20 26:8 27:2, 19, 20 28:7 31:12 32:16 35:4  
**different** 7:6, 10 10:14 33:5 34:13 40:1

**differential** 23:17, 20  
**difficulties** 4:8  
**difficulty** 29:2  
**directives** 40:3  
**Director** 3:4 21:5  
**Directorate** 30:5  
**Directorate's** 17:9  
**discussed** 37:11  
**discussion** 29:14  
**discussions** 39:21  
**disparage** 7:7  
**dissemination** 39:14  
**document** 35:16  
**documentation** 19:11, 14  
**documents** 43:18  
**doing** 6:9 7:13 8:11 17:20 30:16 41:13, 21  
**download** 31:5  
**DPIAC** 4:13 5:2, 14 6:18, 20 7:22 9:11 10:7 15:2, 22 20:15 37:2, 21 38:7, 12 39:5 40:8 42:3 43:15  
**DPIAC's** 16:2 18:17  
**DPO** 41:17  
**Dr** 35:7, 8, 12  
**drop** 12:19  
**due** 33:19  
**Dupree** 2:20 5:20 6:4 9:21 10:8 13:20 14:13, 15 22:18 35:21 38:5 39:4 43:21  
**dynamic** 19:11  
**< E >**  
**early** 30:14, 15  
**EasyChair** 30:8  
**echo** 7:17 38:4  
**economic** 23:1  
**edited** 28:8  
**Efficiency** 3:5 17:14 19:16 20:22 21:8 27:5  
**effort** 15:13 20:16 29:10  
**efforts** 15:11 31:15 38:6  
**Eight** 33:19  
**either** 24:8 40:2  
**Ellen** 2:8 4:19 8:19, 22 9:2, 4 10:9 13:17  
**email** 14:2 19:21 30:9 37:15  
**emailing** 43:12  
**embed** 16:19  
**emerged** 23:6  
**enable** 22:10  
**encourage** 44:10  
**encrypted** 24:6  
**encryption** 24:5 31:10  
**endeavor** 22:10  
**engage** 30:1, 3  
**engaging** 22:9

**ENHANCING** 3:3 17:8  
22:1 24:13 28:3 29:13  
32:10  
**enlightenment** 25:4, 6  
**ensure** 15:21 18:19  
19:17  
**Enterprise** 17:12 24:14  
35:1  
**entire** 6:12 19:14  
**entries** 24:7  
**era** 9:8  
**especially** 15:14  
**essence** 40:12  
**et** 26:13  
**everybody** 5:22 10:6  
13:11, 20  
**example** 23:19 24:2  
**Examples** 23:10  
**Excellence** 3:7 21:7  
27:3 32:2, 7, 12  
**excited** 9:22 16:4 18:22  
34:11 40:9 41:18  
**exciting** 10:19 31:1  
35:21  
**exist** 31:20  
**expansion** 20:3  
**expect** 20:12  
**expectation** 25:4  
**expert** 22:19, 20 35:8  
**expertise** 16:13 20:16  
**experts** 42:7  
**explain** 26:18 29:12  
**explored** 25:18  
**expose** 26:14  
**extraordinarily** 31:8

## &lt; F &gt;

**face** 5:4  
**faced** 7:15  
**faces** 5:2, 3  
**facility** 21:15  
**falls** 23:3  
**false** 38:15  
**familiar** 5:2  
**family** 6:9  
**February** 27:2 34:12  
43:13  
**Federal** 2:5 25:19  
26:16 39:8, 15 40:18  
42:18 43:16  
**federated** 31:11 34:8  
**feedback** 20:10  
**feel** 12:19 37:15  
**FEMA** 27:21  
**field** 25:7 30:10  
**figured** 25:22  
**Finally** 18:22  
**find** 24:2, 7  
**fine** 11:2 14:3  
**first** 8:18 9:14 27:13

31:15  
**fit** 26:11  
**Fitzpatrick** 11:5, 6  
**FLETC** 27:22  
**floor** 42:15  
**flow** 30:18  
**focus** 18:7 29:16  
**focused** 31:9  
**FOIA** 14:19  
**follow** 44:11  
**followed** 9:15 35:8  
**following** 14:8 16:6  
**food** 27:6  
**force** 16:21  
**forefront** 32:22 33:1, 11  
34:19 35:6  
**foreign** 29:4  
**form** 27:10 28:1  
**formally** 43:10  
**format** 25:18  
**former** 8:5 9:2, 11  
**Fortunately** 8:13  
**forward** 8:12 13:10, 14,  
15 16:18 29:18 33:6  
34:5 41:1 42:2 44:1  
**found** 6:18 28:11  
**four** 22:5 34:3  
**framework** 18:19 39:7  
**Francis** 11:7, 8  
**free** 12:19 37:15  
**friends** 9:6 10:3  
**Frik** 35:12  
**front** 29:16  
**full** 44:13  
**functional** 23:8  
**functionality** 33:2  
**fund** 25:17, 21  
**fundamental** 26:10  
**funding** 28:4  
**funds** 26:6  
**further** 12:21 41:2  
**future** 15:19 18:2 38:9  
41:3 44:16

## &lt; G &gt;

**Garfinkel** 22:17 27:18  
35:20  
**gather** 20:9 40:2  
**gathered** 18:18  
**gathering** 20:4  
**general** 33:8, 12  
**getting** 25:7 30:2 40:20  
**give** 28:1 35:19 42:22  
**given** 15:14 30:17, 21  
**giving** 35:4  
**go** 5:21 6:8 9:17 10:7,  
19, 22 27:7 30:14 31:4  
32:15  
**goal** 26:7  
**goals** 16:17  
**goes** 39:13

**going** 7:7 12:22 13:9  
16:5, 15 23:22 25:13  
28:5 36:3 37:9, 18, 22  
38:10 40:13, 14, 20 41:1,  
6, 21 43:3  
**Good** 4:2 5:5, 7 6:16,  
20 10:18 12:9, 15, 16  
13:1, 2 14:15 23:11  
44:13  
**goodbye** 9:8  
**Google** 37:16  
**gotten** 29:9  
**governance** 18:11 39:6  
**government** 26:11, 15, 17,  
19, 21 27:11, 14 29:21  
30:2 31:20 36:5  
**gracious** 7:19  
**grants** 35:15  
**graphics** 22:21  
**grateful** 14:20 44:10  
**Great** 5:11 6:7, 14 7:14,  
16 8:9 9:6, 9, 12 10:6  
13:8 15:11 21:3 23:4  
35:22 37:17 39:21  
**greatly** 39:4  
**groundwork** 20:3  
**Guard** 6:13 8:5 27:21  
**Guarding** 34:6  
**guests** 4:16  
**guide** 32:17

## &lt; H &gt;

**half** 8:19 31:1  
**hand** 9:1  
**happening** 8:14 35:5  
**happily** 6:4  
**happy** 6:8 33:22  
**hard** 15:21 22:10  
**harder** 5:16  
**hardworking** 14:22  
**Harriet** 11:21  
**headquarters** 19:15  
**heads** 6:12, 14  
**hear** 6:20 13:19 36:14  
**heard** 23:16  
**hearing** 4:8 36:11 44:1  
**heartfelt** 7:19, 20  
**hearts** 13:10  
**held** 21:14  
**Hello** 4:18 5:20 10:3  
**help** 8:16 16:13 19:17,  
19, 20 22:8, 18 29:21  
32:4 33:11 34:17  
**helpful** 36:11, 20, 21  
**helping** 32:17  
**Hewitt** 11:9, 10  
**Hi** 5:6  
**hiccup** 30:12  
**hit** 12:18  
**home** 9:7

**HOMELAND** 1:1, 18  
2:5, 10, 12, 21 3:6 4:21  
6:5 9:4 16:11 17:12  
20:18 21:6, 11, 17 22:16  
23:2 24:13 25:11 26:3  
32:2, 19 34:20, 22 35:15  
**homomorphic** 24:5  
31:10  
**honor** 14:18  
**hope** 15:17  
**hopefully** 13:16 19:19  
41:2 44:13  
**host** 40:4, 5  
**hour** 35:3  
**house** 30:2, 3  
**housekeeping** 13:19  
**huge** 41:12  
**human** 31:11

## &lt; I &gt;

**ICE** 27:22 28:13  
**idea** 21:16 24:12 25:10  
**identifiable** 15:8  
**identify** 17:1 18:2  
19:16, 19  
**identifying** 17:3  
**identity** 23:10  
**Illinois** 34:15  
**imagine** 39:12  
**impacts** 15:9  
**implementing** 17:4  
**important** 16:13 40:15  
41:11, 13  
**improve** 17:15 19:3, 13  
30:18  
**improvements** 20:11  
**improving** 33:12  
**include** 7:13 23:11  
**including** 38:17  
**increased** 19:16  
**increasingly** 23:13  
**incredible** 7:1, 4  
**Indiana** 35:9  
**individuals** 23:19 42:14  
**industry** 24:21  
**inflated** 25:3  
**inform** 18:4  
**Information** 4:14 15:8  
19:6 22:3 40:2  
**initiative** 16:21 19:1  
41:20  
**Innovation** 17:9  
**input** 20:4 36:21  
**inputs** 24:2  
**inspection** 43:19  
**inspire** 29:18, 22  
**instructions** 28:19  
**integrate** 21:21  
**INTEGRITY** 1:3 2:17  
3:10 4:4 13:5 15:8



interaction 31:11  
 interactions 24:15  
 interest 44:10  
 interesting 35:4  
 interestingly 5:14  
 internal 19:7 20:8  
 internally 18:4, 13 28:7  
 interpreted 35:17  
 intersection 36:4  
 intersections 24:7  
 invited 27:6  
 inviting 37:14  
 involved 40:15  
 issue 15:9 40:18 41:11  
 issued 38:14  
 issues 15:5, 7  
 ITEM 2:2 3:2  
 items 26:1  
 its 18:20 33:4

## &lt; J &gt;

January 1:12 25:9 34:4  
 JASON 24:21  
 Jean 35:8  
 John 2:11 9:11 11:13  
 join 4:16 13:17  
 joined 44:7  
 joining 4:7, 22 12:17  
 13:3 35:12 42:19  
 joint 22:9  
 Joseph 11:9  
 journey 10:5 44:1  
 Jr 1:19  
 July 27:7 33:15  
 jumping 4:22  
 June 21:14

## &lt; K &gt;

keep 6:2 42:17  
 keeping 22:12  
 key 16:15 23:16  
 kick 35:7  
 kicked 34:12  
 kind 5:1 9:7 10:9  
 King 1:19  
 knew 24:18 28:6  
 Knight 11:11, 12  
 know 4:9 5:14, 15 6:3  
 7:12 8:7, 9, 15 9:2, 13  
 16:9 21:22 41:14  
 Kropf 9:11 11:13, 14

## &lt; L &gt;

lab 22:7  
 lack 33:8, 13  
 laid 20:2  
 late 5:12  
 launch 20:12  
 laws 23:19  
 Layer 23:11

lead 30:18 39:11  
 leaders 26:8  
 leadership 6:12 9:19  
 10:11, 12  
 leading 8:3 23:3 35:1  
 leaning 16:19 33:6  
 learn 24:1 35:4  
 learned 28:17 30:11  
 learning 31:11 34:10  
 led 31:22  
 legal 18:14, 20  
 lessons 28:17 30:11  
 levels 22:13  
 life 6:7  
 lightly 40:19  
 limiting 23:18  
 linkability 23:9  
 Lisa 2:16 9:9 12:7, 22  
 38:3 41:5  
 list 31:4 40:5  
 listed 28:15  
 literally 6:13  
 little 20:20 27:8 29:1  
 30:12, 17, 19  
 lock-in 33:4  
 longer 6:10  
 look 4:14 6:2, 19 8:12  
 9:8 40:7 41:1 42:2  
 43:22  
 looking 26:1 38:11 42:1  
 looks 13:15  
 lot 9:6 26:21 29:16  
 39:20 41:14 42:7  
 lots 5:2  
 lovely 13:18  
 low 22:13  
 Lu 35:10  
 luck 13:9  
 luminaries 35:2  
 lunch-and 35:3  
 Luther 1:19  
 Lynn 2:20 5:17, 19 6:3,  
 6, 15, 17 7:1, 12 9:8, 13,  
 19, 21 10:4, 6 13:7, 9  
 14:13 21:4 22:17 35:20  
 43:21

## &lt; M &gt;

ma'am 43:8  
 Machine 34:9  
 Maciejewski 3:4 20:20  
 21:3, 5 37:13, 16  
 Mail 1:19  
 main 28:17 30:11  
 making 29:16  
 manage 19:3 20:8  
 management 23:10 30:7  
 managers 26:8  
 manual 20:1  
 March 27:17

Mark 11:7  
 Martin 1:19  
 Mary 2:8 4:19 8:19, 21  
 9:2, 4 10:9 13:17  
 Mason 5:17, 21 7:13  
 8:1, 3, 6, 11 41:16, 18  
 material 35:13  
 materials 4:12 44:13  
 matters 13:19  
 mechanisms 31:19 32:4  
 33:12  
 MEETING 1:3, 6, 10  
 3:12 4:4, 12, 14 6:11, 18  
 13:4 14:5, 7, 8 15:20  
 16:14 18:20 36:9 37:9  
 38:11 39:5 43:8 44:6, 9,  
 15  
 meetings 25:20 29:12  
 39:20, 22 40:10  
 member 14:10  
 MEMBERS 3:11 4:6  
 13:21 15:2 16:3 37:2  
 41:8 42:15, 22 44:4, 5, 6  
 messiness 26:19  
 methodologies 17:16  
 methods 40:2  
 Michael 11:5  
 mics 4:9 13:21  
 migrate 22:6  
 military 8:4, 5  
 minimization 38:19  
 minimizing 22:3  
 minute 5:4, 12  
 minutes 10:19 42:17  
 43:1 44:15  
 missed 12:17  
 mission 10:13 15:10, 17  
 18:20  
 mitigate 17:1  
 mitigation 19:18  
 modifications 19:9  
 modify 19:7  
 months 10:1 27:8 30:16  
 monumental 7:14  
 morning 4:2 5:5, 7  
 10:18 12:9, 15, 16 13:1,  
 2 14:16 38:5  
 move 25:5 33:6 36:9  
 37:18  
 moved 13:13  
 moving 6:6 29:18 34:5  
 multiparty 23:22 24:16  
 31:10  
 multiplier 16:22  
 mute 4:9 12:18 13:21  
 36:16 37:4

< N >  
 names 5:3  
 nation's 20:18

near 41:3 44:16  
 nearly 22:5  
 neat 31:7  
 necessary 38:18  
 need 8:10, 16 22:17  
 40:19  
 needed 26:18 27:10  
 29:12, 15 30:13  
 needs 5:15 18:14 20:5  
 21:18 25:12 26:15 28:3  
 networks 30:9  
 never 8:13  
 new 10:4 13:16 22:11  
 26:10 40:10  
 newer 29:5  
 nice 5:2 9:1 33:16, 17  
 36:2  
 Non-IID 34:8  
 notable 15:14  
 note 41:16 43:15  
 notice 42:18  
 Notre 34:15  
 November 24:14, 22  
 Number 6:3

## &lt; O &gt;

OBIM 28:13  
 obviously 7:18 8:8 39:2  
 OCHIO 28:13  
 October 33:19  
 Odutola 11:15  
 offered 26:9  
 Office 2:9, 18 7:9 8:6, 8,  
 15 10:10 13:12, 14 14:6  
 15:21 16:4 17:3 18:16  
 19:4, 5 21:9 22:16, 22  
 24:16 25:10, 16, 21 26:3,  
 5 27:18 32:3, 6 34:20  
 35:22 36:6 43:21 44:7  
 Officer 2:20 8:2 9:3, 15,  
 20 14:13, 19, 20 19:6  
 30:5  
 officers 19:7 27:19  
 Offices 20:5  
 Office's 16:16 19:7  
 Official 2:5 35:18  
 officials 18:4  
 Okay 5:11, 21, 22 6:16  
 28:1 36:14, 15 43:4, 9  
 old 9:6  
 once 43:3  
 one-on-one 29:12  
 Onion 23:12  
 open 37:2 41:4 42:15,  
 21 44:19  
 OPENING 2:7 5:9  
 10:21  
 operates 43:15  
 Operational 3:5 15:6  
 17:14, 21 18:14 20:22

21:7 22:7 27:4  
**operations** 23:1 24:6  
**opinion** 40:14  
**opportunities** 26:9 34:21  
**opportunity** 14:17, 21  
 15:18 23:4  
**Optimizer** 34:8  
**ORDER** 2:3 4:5 27:3  
 40:11  
**organization** 28:5  
**originally** 23:7  
**originate** 24:14  
**OSTP** 25:20  
**Ostrovsky** 35:7  
**outcomes** 15:11  
**outset** 38:14  
**outstanding** 7:1  
**overall** 30:16, 20  
**overlaps** 9:10

## &lt; P &gt;

**pace** 22:8  
**PAGE** 2:2 3:2 44:12  
**Pahl** 11:17, 18  
**Palmer** 11:19, 20  
**papers** 27:15 30:4, 7  
 31:3, 4, 6 33:17 41:2  
**Parker** 2:20 6:3 9:21  
 14:13 22:17 35:20 38:5  
 39:4 43:21  
**part** 10:13 40:7  
**participants** 39:17  
**participated** 44:5  
**participation** 27:13  
**particularly** 38:7  
**partner** 31:20  
**partnering** 8:12  
**partners** 26:16 27:11,  
 14 36:1  
**partnership** 17:7 25:19  
 32:5 36:5  
**pass** 32:15  
**Pause** 4:17  
**PCLOB** 9:16  
**peak** 25:3  
**Pearson** 11:21, 22  
**people** 7:3 21:17 25:11  
**perform** 24:9  
**performing** 24:6  
**period** 29:11 30:22  
 42:12  
**personally** 15:7  
**perspective** 18:18  
**PET** 30:4  
**PETs** 22:1 23:6 26:9,  
 11, 18, 20 27:15 29:21  
 36:12, 19  
**PETS-4-HSE** 30:12  
**PETS4HSE.org** 28:11  
 31:5

**phase** 33:21  
**phone** 42:19  
**picture** 6:17  
**pictures** 6:15  
**plan** 17:22  
**plaques** 6:15  
**platform** 19:11  
**play** 17:3 26:4  
**please** 4:8, 9, 13 13:21  
 14:2, 9 37:4, 15 41:7  
 42:6 43:11, 13 44:11  
**pleasure** 13:8 21:4, 8  
**points** 39:21  
**policies** 35:18  
**policy** 7:11 15:6 26:12  
 39:7, 10  
**policy-related** 39:11  
**ponder** 37:10  
**portion** 14:1 43:10  
**positions** 10:12  
**positives** 38:15  
**possible** 15:12  
**posted** 30:7 44:16  
**potential** 29:19, 20  
 31:16, 19  
**practical** 22:11  
**practice** 17:21 22:12  
**practices** 19:19 26:20  
**practitioners** 21:11 22:9  
**preregistered** 42:14  
**present** 11:2, 6 12:6, 12  
**presentation** 25:3 35:14  
 36:18  
**presentations** 24:20  
**presented** 31:3  
**preserving** 23:14  
**pressing** 42:20  
**pretty** 6:2, 11 8:15  
 23:11  
**previous** 38:10 39:5  
 40:3  
**principle** 38:19  
**prior** 7:10  
**PRIORITIES** 2:19 16:19  
**PRIV** 19:8  
**PRIVACY** 1:3 2:16, 18,  
 20 3:3, 10 4:4 7:9 8:2,  
 8, 14 9:3, 15, 20 10:3, 10,  
 13 13:4, 12 14:6, 13, 19  
 15:9, 20 16:1, 4, 7, 10, 16,  
 19 17:1, 3, 7, 18 18:14,  
 16, 21 19:3, 4, 6, 7, 18  
 20:5 21:9, 22 22:16, 19  
 23:3, 11, 13, 17, 19, 20  
 24:12, 16 25:9, 12, 14, 16,  
 21 27:18, 19 28:2 29:12  
 30:6 31:12 32:9, 21  
 33:1, 7, 11 34:20 35:10,  
 22 36:6 43:21 44:7, 13  
**privacycommittee@hq.dh**  
**s.gov** 14:2 43:12

**privacy-enhancing** 17:4,  
 11, 16 18:3 21:12, 18  
 25:6 26:14 29:5 30:10  
 31:8 33:9 34:18, 22  
 35:6  
**privacy-preserving** 23:14  
 34:7, 9  
**private** 9:17 17:7 24:6,  
 9  
**PRIV-CATS** 19:10 20:7,  
 11, 12, 13  
**privilege** 14:18  
**problem** 27:20 28:21  
**problems** 22:10, 11  
**process** 19:14 33:21  
**procure** 33:5  
**procurement** 33:1  
**productive** 39:20  
**professional** 15:14  
**program** 14:12 26:8  
 30:15  
**programmatic** 15:6  
**programs** 17:2, 18 18:5  
 19:3 20:8 22:22 26:6  
 32:3, 6 38:16 39:8, 15  
 40:18  
**progress** 16:17 19:1  
**Project** 17:10  
**projects** 32:9 34:14  
**promise** 22:1  
**promising** 17:15  
**promoted** 30:8  
**promoting** 17:4  
**proposal** 21:1 32:11  
 33:15  
**proposals** 32:8, 14 33:18,  
 19, 20 34:1, 3, 5 36:3  
**propose** 32:9  
**protect** 16:7  
**protecting** 16:11 20:17  
**provide** 19:2 20:20  
 33:12 39:16 40:12  
**provided** 15:4 27:5 31:3  
**providing** 18:10 39:5  
 41:1  
**provisions** 43:16  
**pseudonymity** 23:10  
**PUBLIC** 1:6 3:11 4:4,  
 7, 11 13:21 14:1, 7, 8, 22  
 16:11 29:6 42:11, 13, 16,  
 22 43:7, 10, 17, 18 44:5,  
 9  
**publicly** 28:10, 13  
**publish** 23:18  
**publishing** 23:14  
**purpose** 14:5 38:18  
**put** 22:11 27:7, 9, 12  
 29:10 32:12 34:2 36:1,  
 16

## &lt; Q &gt;

**Q&A** 4:11  
**Query** 34:8  
**question** 32:1  
**QUESTIONS** 3:11  
 25:16 36:9 37:3, 15  
 40:6 41:5, 7  
**quick** 11:1  
**quickly** 8:15  
**quite** 39:13 40:13

## &lt; R &gt;

**range** 23:7 31:8  
**ranks** 41:18  
**Raphail** 35:7  
**Ray** 12:11  
**ready** 8:7 30:14  
**really** 6:20, 22 7:4, 14,  
 16, 19 9:1, 22 10:1  
 16:21 19:10, 21 22:16  
 23:4 30:20 31:1 34:11  
 35:19, 21 36:2, 4, 11, 17,  
 18, 20 41:19 43:22  
**real-term** 25:8  
**reappointments** 16:3  
**reasons** 7:11  
**recall** 18:9  
**receive** 14:6 29:8  
**recommendations** 15:5  
 16:6 18:10, 17 38:16  
 39:1, 6  
**record** 12:20  
**records** 24:11  
**reduce** 19:20, 21 38:15  
**reformation** 40:8  
**Register** 42:18  
**related** 15:7 38:1 39:7  
**relatively** 29:11  
**releasable** 29:17  
**release** 28:10  
**released** 28:13 38:21  
**relevant** 26:5  
**reliance** 19:21  
**REMARKS** 2:7, 15 5:10  
 10:22 41:11 42:17  
**remember** 4:9 30:15  
 33:15  
**remind** 13:20 42:16  
**renewed** 16:2  
**report** 24:21 33:22  
 38:14, 21 39:2  
**reports** 33:16  
**represented** 39:17  
**representing** 6:21, 22  
 35:18  
**request** 33:14, 19  
**requests** 21:1  
**required** 29:14  
**requirements** 18:21  
 20:6 23:8

**research** 17:15, 20 22:7  
 23:1 32:9 35:3  
**researchers** 17:19 22:5,  
 9 25:13 26:14, 15, 19  
 27:16 29:22 30:4 31:9,  
 15, 18 32:13 34:14  
**respect** 18:14 33:7  
**respond** 32:13  
**response** 11:4, 16 37:6  
 41:9 43:2  
**responsibilities** 15:15  
**results** 24:1 30:21  
**retrieved** 24:10  
**returning** 9:7  
**revealing** 24:1, 3, 8, 10  
**review** 27:10 32:14, 15  
 33:21  
**revised** 20:12  
**RFP** 33:10 36:2  
**right** 4:2 5:22 12:21  
 37:5, 17 40:12 42:10  
 43:3  
**risk** 19:18 22:3, 12 23:2  
**risks** 17:1 28:4  
**role** 17:3 41:22  
**ROLL** 2:13 4:15 10:20,  
 22 30:17  
**Romanosky** 12:1, 2  
**Ron** 12:13  
**room** 24:3  
**Ross** 3:4 20:19 21:4  
 36:10 37:7, 16  
**Router** 23:12  
**run** 22:21 27:4  
**Russell** 12:3, 4

< S >

**S&T** 17:13  
**sad** 6:7  
**sadly** 6:4  
**safeguarding** 16:10  
**safeguards** 18:21  
**Sarah** 11:11  
**Sasha** 12:1  
**satisfy** 38:18  
**saying** 13:11 28:1  
**scheduled** 43:7  
**scheduling** 40:10  
**Science** 17:8 22:19  
 23:1, 2  
**screening** 38:16  
**SE** 1:19  
**search** 24:9, 10  
**second** 4:22 27:15  
**Secret** 27:22  
**Secretary** 2:9, 11 4:20  
 6:9, 22 9:18 10:8  
**Secretary's** 7:17  
**sector** 9:17 17:7  
**secure** 23:21 24:22 34:7

**SECURITY** 1:1, 18 2:6,  
 10, 12, 21 3:6 4:21 6:5  
 9:4 17:12 21:6, 12, 17  
 23:2, 12 24:14 25:11  
 26:3 31:9 32:3, 19  
 34:20 35:1, 15  
**Security's** 22:16  
**see** 5:2 6:8 9:6, 9, 12  
 10:6 13:18 26:1 32:16  
 35:5 36:5  
**seeing** 4:8  
**seeking** 31:18  
**seen** 42:13  
**selected** 34:1, 3  
**seminar** 34:21  
**sendoff** 6:15  
**senior** 6:12  
**sense** 26:2  
**sensitive** 22:2 34:6  
 40:18  
**series** 34:21  
**servants** 14:22  
**serve** 8:1 14:18 32:17  
**service** 7:2 13:7 15:2  
 27:22 43:22  
**session** 4:13 14:9, 11  
 44:18, 20  
**set** 24:7  
**setting** 26:21  
**setup** 5:16  
**share** 16:16 18:22 28:16  
**sharing** 20:16 22:2  
**Sharon** 11:3  
**shoehorned** 6:19  
**short** 6:2 28:2 29:11  
**showing** 36:3  
**side** 30:2, 3 31:12 35:10  
**significant** 19:1 20:4  
**silence** 37:8  
**Silicon** 17:9  
**similar** 6:10  
**Similarly** 7:22  
**simple** 11:1  
**simply** 31:14  
**Simson** 22:17 27:18  
 35:20  
**sir** 5:5, 8 9:5  
**sit** 7:7  
**site** 30:14  
**Siu** 12:5, 6  
**six** 27:8 30:16  
**six-week** 30:22  
**skills** 26:13  
**sledding** 7:9  
**slide** 28:14, 16 34:2  
**slides** 25:2 37:9  
**slope** 25:4, 5  
**slow** 22:6  
**smart** 14:22  
**Software** 35:11

**solicited** 27:19  
**soliciting** 28:18  
**solutions** 25:15 33:3  
**solve** 22:10, 11  
**solved** 18:3  
**somebody** 36:16  
**Sorry** 5:11 34:2  
**sort** 29:3 30:22 31:22  
 33:10  
**sorts** 15:5 25:22  
**Sotto** 2:16 12:7, 8 13:1,  
 2 36:10 37:7, 17 41:6,  
 10 42:4, 10 43:3, 9  
**Speak** 5:5 13:15 42:16  
**speakers** 27:6  
**speaking** 36:15  
**special** 9:14  
**specific** 17:18 20:6  
 28:19 33:2  
**Specifically** 19:4 27:19  
**specify** 33:2  
**speed** 22:8  
**spend** 35:3  
**spent** 20:3  
**spoke** 9:18  
**Staff** 2:8 4:20 8:20, 21  
**start** 5:9 10:19 32:4, 20  
 36:3  
**started** 26:4 38:4  
**starting** 34:12  
**State** 21:15 34:16  
**STATEMENTS** 3:12  
 27:20 28:21  
**States** 27:16  
**statistical** 23:18, 21  
**status** 21:1  
**stay** 14:9  
**staying** 8:3  
**Stealth** 35:11  
**stepping** 41:22  
**STEPS** 3:8 40:22  
**Steve** 35:10  
**stint** 9:17  
**Stop** 1:19  
**strategic** 8:17  
**strong** 22:15  
**structural** 31:18  
**structure** 18:11  
**stunned** 37:7  
**Subcommittee** 3:9 37:21  
 39:10, 16  
**subcommittees** 39:9  
**subcommittee's** 37:22  
**submission** 30:22  
**submissions** 30:21 31:2  
**submit** 28:7 43:11  
**submitted** 33:20  
**subsequent** 38:21  
**Substantively** 8:7  
**success** 17:11

**successful** 10:11  
**summer** 21:8  
**supplement** 39:1  
**support** 10:15 17:19  
 22:15, 18 27:5, 6 28:9  
**sure** 24:19  
**swirl** 36:19 41:12  
**switch** 28:22  
**symposium** 24:13  
**synthesize** 18:16  
**system** 30:8 32:22  
**systems** 18:6 26:12  
  
 < T >  
**tackled** 7:14  
**take** 4:15, 16 10:19  
 14:17 25:12 37:4 39:11  
 40:7, 19  
**taken** 39:9 40:15  
**talk** 20:6 25:14 35:2  
**talking** 25:3 26:16  
**task** 8:7 27:3  
**tasked** 18:9 38:11  
**TASKING** 3:8 37:19  
 38:1 39:12, 18 40:7, 11  
**taskings** 40:15  
**teach** 26:7  
**Team** 5:16 7:5, 12 23:4  
**technical** 20:6  
**technological** 16:20  
**TECHNOLOGIES** 3:3  
 17:5, 8, 11, 16 18:3  
 21:13, 18 22:1, 4, 12  
 24:13 25:6 29:5, 13  
 31:9, 14 32:10, 18 33:6,  
 9 34:18, 22 35:5, 6, 11  
**Technology** 3:9 17:9  
 18:5 23:13 24:19 26:14  
 28:3 30:10 31:16 33:5  
 37:21 39:13, 15  
**Teitzel** 3:9 12:9, 10  
 37:19 38:3  
**tell** 5:17 28:3  
**template** 28:6, 18  
**ten** 21:5  
**tenure** 10:15 13:12  
**term** 23:6  
**terminology** 28:20  
**terms** 7:11 23:16 24:10  
 29:4  
**terrific** 8:2 36:12, 22  
 41:13 42:7, 10  
**testing** 20:9  
**thank** 8:3 9:5 10:6, 8,  
 14, 15 12:7, 16 13:2, 3, 6  
 14:15 15:2, 16 16:12  
 20:15 21:2, 3 22:17  
 36:9, 10 37:1, 8, 12, 13,  
 16 38:1, 3 41:6, 13, 21  
 42:1, 4, 9 43:21 44:3, 4,

<p>6  <b>thankfully</b> 8:22  <b>Thanks</b> 5:12, 22 8:11  35:20 43:8, 20  <b>thing</b> 30:13  <b>things</b> 5:9, 15 23:21  30:19 35:5 43:5  <b>think</b> 6:3, 19 9:10, 13  13:10 21:20 31:17 36:1,  2, 13, 15, 18 37:7, 8  <b>thinking</b> 26:10, 22 32:21  <b>Thomas</b> 12:5, 11, 12  <b>thought</b> 5:3 6:16 9:1  <b>three</b> 33:22 34:3, 4, 5  42:17  <b>thrilled</b> 30:20  <b>throw</b> 5:3  <b>thrown</b> 5:8  <b>Tien</b> 2:11 5:7, 11, 19, 21  <b>tightly</b> 38:20  <b>time</b> 4:8, 10 15:13  16:12 20:4, 16 29:11  30:18, 22 40:16  <b>times</b> 12:19  <b>title</b> 28:1  <b>today</b> 4:7 13:3, 18  14:16 28:4  <b>today's</b> 4:13 14:5 16:14  44:6, 9, 15  <b>tool</b> 19:2, 8, 10, 12  <b>topic</b> 41:15  <b>toss</b> 41:5  <b>tougher</b> 7:9  <b>track</b> 19:13  <b>tracking</b> 19:8 20:1  <b>training</b> 26:13  <b>transformative</b> 38:8  <b>translate</b> 17:20  <b>transparency</b> 15:9  <b>Transport</b> 23:11  <b>travel</b> 27:6  <b>treated</b> 43:17  <b>tremendous</b> 13:14  <b>Trigeneous</b> 34:6  <b>try</b> 11:1 21:20 32:8  34:17  <b>trying</b> 25:5 28:22  <b>TSA</b> 27:22  <b>Tuesday</b> 1:12  <b>turn</b> 4:10 10:20 12:22  14:12 15:22 19:10  20:19 36:8 37:18, 20  42:11 44:17  <b>twice</b> 43:4  <b>Twitter</b> 30:9  <b>two</b> 14:20 21:21 24:8  25:2 27:12 28:22 33:20  <b>type</b> 34:2    &lt; U &gt;</p>	<p><b>U.S</b> 1:1, 18 2:5, 9, 11, 21  3:5 24:17  <b>umbrella</b> 23:3  <b>unable</b> 12:18  <b>unauthorized</b> 22:4  <b>unclassified</b> 29:7  <b>undergo</b> 32:14  <b>understand</b> 18:13 20:5  <b>understanding</b> 10:12  17:17 26:17  <b>underwent</b> 33:20  <b>undetectability</b> 23:9  <b>uniform</b> 18:21  <b>unique</b> 36:4  <b>United</b> 27:16  <b>University</b> 21:16 22:22  26:4, 6 32:3, 6 34:15, 16  35:9  <b>unmute</b> 42:20  <b>unobservability</b> 23:9  <b>upcoming</b> 36:3  <b>UPDATE</b> 2:18 3:3  16:15 37:18, 22 41:2  <b>UPDATE/NEXT</b> 3:8  <b>updates</b> 14:6 35:4  <b>USCIS</b> 27:21 28:14  <b>use</b> 18:2, 8, 11, 19 19:3  20:7, 14 22:2, 4, 7 24:18  25:8 27:11, 14, 19 28:8,  10, 12, 15, 21 29:6, 9, 14,  16, 18 30:2 33:17 38:22  39:3, 7, 14 40:16 42:8  <b>useful</b> 29:20 31:12  44:14  <b>user</b> 20:9 32:17  <b>user-centric</b> 35:10  <b>users</b> 29:19 31:16, 19  <b>uses</b> 23:20 29:3, 8, 20  <b>ushering</b> 41:19    &lt; V &gt;  <b>validate</b> 33:3  <b>Valley</b> 17:9  <b>valuable</b> 20:10  <b>vamping</b> 5:6  <b>variety</b> 34:13  <b>various</b> 40:3  <b>vending</b> 25:18  <b>vendor</b> 33:3, 4  <b>venue</b> 27:6  <b>venues</b> 26:1  <b>version</b> 20:12  <b>views</b> 39:6  <b>Virtual</b> 1:10  <b>vision</b> 17:2 19:9  <b>visualization</b> 22:20  <b>volunteering</b> 16:12    &lt; W &gt;  <b>wait</b> 36:5 44:2</p>	<p><b>want</b> 7:17 10:2 16:2  29:6 31:17 33:6 38:4  41:16 42:5 43:14  <b>wanted</b> 14:17 15:1  24:18 26:13 35:19  42:14  <b>wants</b> 32:16 40:7  <b>Washington</b> 1:20 21:15  <b>way</b> 6:19 9:9 26:10  32:11 38:13 44:12  <b>ways</b> 7:6 13:14  <b>Web</b> 44:12  <b>website</b> 4:13 28:11  <b>weeks</b> 40:21  <b>welcome</b> 4:3 8:1 13:4  41:18  <b>well</b> 7:21 8:5 9:12  20:10 21:19 24:15  25:17 26:12 28:15 31:6  39:17 40:4 43:9  <b>we're</b> 25:13 37:9  <b>We've</b> 36:11  <b>white</b> 27:15 30:4, 6  31:2, 4, 6 33:17  <b>Whitworth</b> 12:14, 15  <b>William</b> 2:4, 14  <b>wish</b> 13:9 38:8  <b>wishes</b> 10:4, 16  <b>wishing</b> 7:21  <b>within26s</b> 26:11  <b>wonderful</b> 10:2  <b>words</b> 5:1 10:9 28:22  <b>work</b> 7:14 8:9 9:22  15:18 16:5, 6, 13, 22  17:6, 22 21:2, 9 22:20  32:11 35:14, 22 38:6  40:3, 13 41:12 44:11  <b>worked</b> 14:21 27:21  34:19  <b>working</b> 13:8 15:21  18:12 21:12, 19 22:22  27:17 30:9 32:6 34:13  39:22 40:3, 22 41:2  42:2  <b>works</b> 20:10  <b>workshop</b> 17:12, 14  20:21 21:10, 14 22:7, 14  24:16 25:10 26:7 27:9  31:3, 6 33:10, 15, 16  36:2  <b>workshops</b> 18:1  <b>world</b> 27:12  <b>wound</b> 28:12 31:2  <b>write</b> 14:3  <b>written</b> 43:11, 17  <b>wrong</b> 8:16    &lt; Y &gt;  <b>year</b> 8:19 20:14 32:8  <b>years</b> 14:20 36:7</p>	<p><b>yielded</b> 15:11</p>
---	---	--	-----------------------------