

U.S. Department of Homeland Security  
Homeland Security Advisory Council Meeting  
Conference Call  
Tuesday, August 18, 2020  
Meeting Minutes  
1:45pm – 3:15pm ET

The open session of the Homeland Security Advisory Council (HSAC) meeting was convened on August 18, 2020 from 1:45pm to 3:15 pm. The meeting was open to members of the public under the provisions of the Federal Advisory Committee Act (FACA), P.L. 92-463 and 5 U.S.C. § 552b.

The following individuals attended the meeting: HSAC Members:

**HSAC Members**

William Bratton (Chair)  
Karen Tandy (Vice Chair)  
William Webster (Chair Emeritus)  
Art Acevedo  
Steve Adegbite  
Jayson Ahern  
Keith Alexander  
John Allen  
Thad Allen  
Stewart Baker  
Robert Bonner  
James Carafano  
Frank Cilluffo  
John F. Clark  
Sharon Cooper  
Mark Dannels  
Leon Fresco  
James Fuller  
Paul Goldenberg  
Jane Harman  
Michael P. Jackson  
Jim Jones  
Daniel Kaniewski  
Cathy Lanier  
Carie A. Lemack  
John Magaw  
Hans C. Miller  
Jeffery Miller  
Jeff Moss  
Chris Nocco  
Cynthia Renaud

Robert Rose  
Harold A. Schaitberger  
Ali H. Soufan  
Paul Stockton  
Chad Sweet  
Mark Weatherford  
Brian White

**DHS Participants**

John H. Hill, Assistant Secretary, Office of Partnership and Engagement  
Mike Miron, Acting Executive Director, Homeland Security Advisory Council  
Garret Conover, Director, Homeland Security Advisory Council  
Evan Hughes, Associate Director, Homeland Security Advisory Council  
Colleen Silva, Junior Analyst, Office of Partnership and Engagement

## **Mike Miron**

Good afternoon and thank you for joining us today. My name is Mike Miron I am the Acting Executive Director of the Homeland Security Advisory Council. This is a public meeting of the Homeland Security Advisory Council and we appreciate those members of the public and media who have joined us virtually today. For the record, we have 31 members of the council participating in today's meeting; 11 in person and 20 virtually.

The Homeland Security Council, also known as the HSAC, is a federal advisory committee at the Department of Homeland Security under the Federal Advisory Committee Act. These meetings are open to the public. Executive summary and meeting minutes will be posted on the DHS website at [www.dhs.gov/HSAC](http://www.dhs.gov/HSAC) and also in the public database within 90 days of today's meeting.

This morning Acting Secretary Chad F. Wolf awarded Judge William Webster the Distinguished Public Service medal, our department's highest honor. Acting Secretary Chad F. Wolf stated, "I'm profoundly grateful for Judge Webster's dedication to protecting the homeland and for the wise advice he has provided to this department since its earliest days."

Secretary Wolf also appointed today three new members to the HSAC. They are Daniel Kaniewski, who is with Marsh and McLennan companies where he is serving as Managing Director for the Public Sector Innovation. He brings a tremendous amount of disaster relief experience having previously served as a FEMA's Deputy Administrator for Resilience. Dr. Sharon Cooper is a noted development and a forensic pediatrician. She will be joining us from the Womack Army Medical Center in Fort Bragg, North Carolina. She has spent her career evaluating children who have been victims of abuse and she will be an excellent asset to DHS and is ongoing efforts to eradicate child sexual exploitation. John Clark, President and CEO of the National Center for Missing Exploited Children, will also be joining the HSAC. Prior to his role at the Center, Clark spent 28 years with the US Marshals Service becoming its 9th Director in 2006. Like Dr. Cooper, his experience will also be extremely useful to our counter human trafficking encountered child sexual exploitation efforts.

In addition to these three new members, the Acting Secretary also announced some HSAC leadership changes. After 17 years of exemplary service on the HSAC, including 14 as the HSAC Chair Judge William Webster will move from his position as Chair and serve as the HSAC Chair Emeritus. The new Chair will be William Bratton. During his nearly 15 years in law enforcement, Mr. Bratton has led 6 police departments. This includes seven as Los Angeles Police Department, Chief of Police, and two nonconsecutive terms as New York City Police Commissioner. The new Vice-Chair will be Miss Karen Tandy, the former Administrator of the Drug Enforcement Administration and the first woman to hold that position with more than 40 years of leadership experience throughout both the public and private sectors. She will be an excellent addition to the HSAC leadership.

Lastly, the Acting Secretary also introduced a new tasking. Included in this Academic Institution Subcommittee mandate will be: 1. The threat of malign foreign influence and interference in our academic institutions, 2. The openness of academic research and the exchange of ideas between institutions of higher education and DHS, 3. Promoting campus resilience resources to address a range of threats or hazards affecting institutions of K-12 and higher education, 4. International student engagement, and 5. Monitoring student visa recipients who violate their status.

At this time, I would like to turn it over to the chair of the HSAC William Bratton for a few remarks, the floor is yours.

### **William Bratton**

Thank you, Mike. My name is Bill Bratton and I am the Chair of the Homeland Security Advisory Council following the many years of dedicated service with Judge Webster. I welcome you to the open session for today's meeting where we will see progress reports from our Economic Security, Biometrics, Information and Communication Technology Risk Reduction, and Youth Engagement Subcommittees. We will also receive a final report from the Emerging Technology Subcommittee. I'd like to welcome my HSAC members both new and continuing, and those from the public who are joining us virtually. Special thank you to the HSAC staff and Mike Miron, and the people who work with him for their continuous support of the Council's hard work. Lastly, I'd like to thank all the members who are serving on these important subcommittees and I look forward to hearing the presentations today. With that I'll turn it over to Vice-Chair Karen Tandy for remarks. Karen.

### **Karen Tandy**

Thank you, Bill. My name is Karen Tandy and I am the Vice-Chair of the Homeland Security Advisory Council and I welcome you to the open session of today's meeting. I especially want to add to the gratitude that Commissioner Bratton expressed for Judge Webster with my own as well. I can speak for the rest of the members of the HSAC, Judge Webster, thank you for your incredible leadership that has brought us all to this point for many years of the HSAC and its ability to attract the talent around this table, and to assist the Department of Homeland Security on some of the most challenging issues that it has. Thank you, Judge Webster. At this time, I'll turn the mic back over to Mike Miron.

### **Mike Miron**

Thank you. At this time, we will begin hearing the progress reports from the current four taskings that we have. If we can get that microphone over to Frank Cilluffo, Stewart Baker, and Bob Rose, they are the leadership of the Economic Security Subcommittee and they're going to deliver us their progress report now. The floor is yours.

### **Frank Cilluffo**

Bill and Karen, congratulations on the new appointment and Judge Webster, I think I've had the privilege of knowing you, probably the longest in this room, since the very early 90s, and let me just say you're a mountain of a man and you've done amazing work your entire life and I hold you in the highest regard. So, thank you for your service and for all you've done for this country. We all owe you a debt of gratitude. So, thank you for that.

I'll be very brief since I don't want to steal too much of our own thunder. We're sort of in purgatory right now. We're through our briefings but we haven't drafted our final report yet. And while we have a number of recommendations that were teeing up, I thought rather than sort of

drip a few here and there we will save that for the actual report itself. Just by way of background, we have been active, and I can't tell you how appreciative I have been of my Vice Chairs Stewart Baker and Bob Rose. They've been energizer bunnies with this group and Evan Hughes for all the incredible work to get these briefings going. I think we received three dozen briefings, all since COVID, all through different formalities, and all through different venues. That includes all the various arms and legs within the Department of Homeland Security. So all the components, all the major offices that have a role in economic security. But we've also spent a lot of time hearing from the intelligence community, and hearing from the Department of Defense, Department of State, Department of Commerce, and Department of Treasury.

Since our primary objective is to figure out what authorities that the Department of Homeland Security can better utilize or maximize to fulfill its role and mission around economic security issues and how the Department can be a better interagency partner in all these issues. That's important because COVID certainly made everyone aware of some of our supply chain concerns and considerations. Quite honestly, these are issues that have been long brewing for quite some time, and while our focus is not exclusively on China, I think it's fair to say that the vast majority of our time and effort has been looking at the tactics, techniques, and procedures that the People's Republic of China, and the Communist Party, in particular, have been engaging in trying to meet some of their objectives.

As some may not know the Department of Homeland Security within the Office of Policy has stood up a new economic security office. One of our mission areas is to make sure we provide some outside counsel and hopefully some outside support to ensure the success of that office. This is a long-winded way of saying right now as a government we've got a lot of tactics masquerading as strategy. In other words, there's a lot of activity across the federal government. Whether it's executive orders that have been promulgated to address the ball power, the grid security, or whether it's the efforts that have been taken around particular initiatives around 5G such as Huawei ZT, or even apps such as Tik Toc. In these other considerations right now one of the things we come to conclude is that these pieces really do have to be integrated and brought together and that the whole has to some extent to be as great as the sum of its parts.

We have a handful of initiatives we are proposing to try to enable that. Stewart's been very diligent to make sure that we don't try to boil oceans here. We've got a lot of activity that we're trying to address, but we don't want to overextend what some of our capabilities. I'm just going to leave with one little thought of one of the recommendations we are going to put forward. So, first and foremost, when we look at our supply chain, we really don't have visibility across our supply chain. One of the initiatives we are looking at, and we've had briefings from again, the intelligence community as well as DHS elements, is looking at how we can maximize some of the collection there. So I tend to not come up with whole new ideas, but one that we probably will be suggesting is that of a supply chain intelligence capability that if you were to look at it across the federal government. DHS is ideally situated to be able to address this, whether it's policy, whether it's EDP, they're all elements that play a role. But that is probably not to steal too much thunder, but that's probably going to be one of our recommendations in terms of additional capacities and capabilities that are needed, but I've never had an unspoken thought. I don't want to go on and on and on and on. I want to turn it over to my Vice-Chair Stewart.

**Stewart Baker**

Great job, Frank. It's been a pleasure to serve with you on this subcommittee and it's been a pleasure to see the extent to which the federal government and DHS has come alive to the challenge that we're going to face in the 21st century of having a military and economic competitor with whom we are not at war and finding ways to construct a coherent strategy and a set of structures in government that address that challenge. I think at the bottom of what we've been asked to do in the context of asking how DHS can respond to that, I agree with Frank that intelligence is about our supply chain is one of the critical elements. I am not looking forward to working on the report because I know how much work that will be, but it has been a great pleasure to work with all of the elements that gave us these things and to see the unanimity across party lines across agencies with which this challenge has been faced. I am definitely looking forward to the point at which we have finished the report, and we can brief the public on it. Thank you.

### **Mike Miron**

Thank you, very much. We will go into the second update which is going to be the Biometric Subcommittee. We have Rob Bonner and Leon Fresco here, the Co-Chair and Vice-Chair. So, I'll go ahead and turn it over to you, Mr. Bonner.

### **Rob Bonner**

OK, thank you, Mike and Commissioner Bratton and Vice-Chair Tandy. I guess it would be remiss if I didn't mention the pleasure it is to serve along with Judge Webster. I'd be remiss if I said too Bill, you really can't say enough about your service to the Homeland Security Advisory Council, and to our nation. So, thank you, Sir.

Let me give you a pretty brief update on the Biometric Subcommittee. The subcommittee has had meetings with six out of the seven Department of Homeland Security component agencies. We've also met with four of the Department of Homeland Security offices that have some real equities with respect to biometrics. We've spoken to five external organizations, including the airline industry and privacy groups. Privacy groups are groups that are interested in the privacy side of the issue of biometrics.

In total now, we've spoken to 31 subject matter experts with respect to biometrics and who are knowledgeable regarding the use and collection of biometrics by component agencies of the Department of Homeland Security. What type of biometrics are employed and for what purposes? How biometric data is shared outside the Department of Homeland Security with other federal law enforcement agencies and state and local, as well as through a bilateral and multilateral arrangements with our international partners. We've certainly taken a hard look at how and are taking a hard look at how biometrics data is stored and protected by the Department and its component agencies.

Also, as I said, the privacy interests that are implicated by the use of biometrics. These briefings that the subcommittee has received have included the current processes and procedures for how the Department of Homeland Security component agencies who use biometrics or have new uses of existing biometrics, particularly by the way facial recognition and how that's done. What the process is and what the current processes are within the Department of Homeland Security for vetting the potential of new uses of biometrics.

We've also received briefings regarding all biometrics or new uses of biometrics. There have been communications to the media, to the hill, and other interested parties and how this outreach process could be improved.

Our fact gathering is substantially completed. We only have a few loose ends remaining and last week the subcommittee met virtually, of course, to discuss potential recommendations. Because we're still formulating recommendations, I think it's premature for me to preview those recommendations since none at this point had been formally adopted by the subcommittee. The subcommittee is presently working on a draft of our report or final report to the HSAC, and we believe we're on track to be able to submit that report. Our recommendations to the HSAC will be complete by the end of September or early October. By the way, I want to say I truly appreciate the tremendous staff support we received from the HSAC, particularly the work of Garrett Conover, it's been excellent. We are now hitting the hard part of putting together a draft of our report and recommendations. So, with that, that's my report. But if there are any questions for me or the Vice Chair Leon Fresco, who is actually in person at the HSAC meeting, we're open to any questions that the members of the HSAC might have for us. Thank you.

### **Mike Miron**

Thank you, Sir. We're going to go to the next subcommittee report. This is on the Information and Communication Technology Risk Reduction Subcommittee. The Chair is Bob Rose, the Vice-Chair Steve Adegbite. Bob, the floor is yours. Sir. Hi, how are you doing? Bob, star 6 to get your phone going. OK. Are you with us? Alright, let's go to the next report. We will get that squared away there. The Youth Engagement Subcommittee we have Carie Lemak, who's the Co-Chair along with Paul Goldenberg, and the Vice-Chair is Sheriff Mark Daniels. Carie, the floor is yours.

### **Paul Goldenberg**

This is Paul. I'll kick it off. So, the three of us are going to make some comments first. Also, I'd like to just say what a privilege it's been to work with Judge Webster. An honor for me and looking forward to working with him in the future as well as Bill Bratton. Of course, Chief Bratton, we sincerely look forward to working with you as well, and Karen Tandy. She is someone I have known for 30 years and have held in the highest regard. The leadership couldn't be better for the current times now so it's an honor and a privilege for me to work with you.

Just starting off, we'd like to thank the Acting Secretary Chad F. Wolf, who was really for months prior to his current appointment as Acting Secretary, and then as a senior member of the DHS staff, someone who frequently offered his encouragement and support on issues that impacted American youth. We had many conversations over the past two years about his deep concerns for those issues and knowing that he has a keen understanding of the complexity this type of mission has. I also want to thank the dedicated HSAC team Mike, Evan, and Colleen who during these very challenging times worked after hours and on weekends in support of, not only this critical testing, but others as well. We remain most honored to be a member of the Secretary's advisory council and I also want to thank all the other members for being there in person and I sincerely wish that I could have been there as well.

We really kicked this off several months ago with trying to best figure out what are the issues we are facing. Nearly 70 million youth that are sitting at home for the first time in modern history. As most know, some are idle and they're sitting at home in front of computer screens, phones, and iPhones. The Youth Engagement Subcommittee really focused on provided findings and recommendations with regard to the best practices for building youth-focused programming that could be implemented nationwide with the team focus on radicalization. We also focused on the concept of grooming which is unfortunately something one of my own my own children years ago experienced personally. The recommendations will align with the department's day one priority of civil rights, civil liberties, and individual privacy protections.

In these efforts the mandate includes studying current department youth-focused programs and any recommended changes to those programs, recommend new youth-based initiatives that can be implemented nationwide to prevent radicalization to violence, while identifying key national partners and identify early prevention and intervention measures such as youth-centered violence prevention programs. We are also asked to identify best practices from federal, state, local law enforcement regarding interactions with youth engagement focused on the prevention of radicalization to violence and to identify initiatives and programs which the department can implement that has been evaluated in round table like discussions with the educational professionals.

We have a department that is so big and there are really are some remarkable programs that are ongoing. Unfortunately, in some cases, they're not always talking to each other, and that's something that we will address more in the report. Look, before the pandemic social media experts, mental health professionals, the academics have been cautioning parents and educators of the increasing risk of online exposure to extremist propaganda and distinctive tactics of groomers and recruiters. Many define online youth radicalization as an action in which a young individual or group of people come to adopt increasingly extreme political, social, or religious ideals and aspirations that reject or undermine the status quo. Also, we can see contemporary ideas and expressions of the nation where youth radicalization can be perceived as both violent and nonviolent. Here we are five months into COVID-19 and as I stated before, nearly 70 million children are now home and sitting in front of PC monitors and mobile devices. This unprecedented situation has created a perfect storm for extremist recruitment and radicalization with excessive isolation and increased online presence on gaming platforms, social media and more has created mounting opportunities for exposure to extremist content which make considerably enhanced pathways that lead to radicalization.

Likewise, the tremendous uncertainty brought on by the pandemic crisis, continued protests, violence, and civil unrest, the questioning of authority, and the lack of trust in government can make the kinds of explanations and scapegoating offered by violent extremists. In the absence of their usual social support systems and networks of trusted adults and peers, as daily interactions with coaches, youth group leaders, employers, teachers, and others have concluded American youth may very well become easy targets for those seeking to radicalize by providing answers for who they can blame for their current plight. We are really, really in a very tough situation right now as many of you know and it's going to really be about awareness. Most folks don't know what the word fortune or the terms 4 Chan, 8 Chan, Reddit, and q Anon are. These conspiracies continue to grow, and they are now very much reaching our young people. We are not in that dissimilar of a situation than years ago when we were concerned about foreign fighters that were leaving the shores of western nations where young disenchanted folks would

up thousands of miles away as a part of an army that literally, or some thought literally, appeared out of nowhere. The fact remains we are in a very similar but more dangerous situation now because now we've got a captive audience and I think our work is very timely. I want to now turn this over to Carie and Mark Daniels my Co-Chair and Vice-Chair. They've been doing a phenomenal job.

### **Carie Lemack**

Thank you. All. To everyone who is in the room and virtual I wish I could see you, but you can't see me because I seem to be having some trouble getting the camera working, so my apologies for that. Before I continue, I would be remiss if I didn't say a huge thank you to Judge Webster for all the work that you have done. It's truly been an honor to be able to work with you. I don't even know how long but long enough to be a real fan of all that you have contributed. I'm really grateful to have the opportunity and I of course also look forward to working with our new Chair, William Bratton and Co-Chair Karen Tandy. So, thank you for the opportunity and of course, I'd be remiss if I didn't say thank you to Paul and Mark Dannels and to everyone on the subcommittee for the tremendous amount of effort that's been put in. None of it could have happened without the fantastic crew at the HSAC Mike Miron, Evan Hughes, and Colleen Silva, so thank you.

I just want to follow up on what Paul was saying about the radicalization cycle. That right now is achieved at little cost. It's as easy and can be isolated or through a globally connected network, but it's almost always online, and with the extraordinary social restrictions that we're seeing right now because of COVID that inhibit children from accessing fellow classmates, their counselors, or any kind of mentor who might have otherwise discourage and refute evolving extremist attitudes.

Groomers and recruiters are eager to seize this moment in time and they are, unfortunately combining the current conditions with the reality that today news and information are consumed differently than we consumed them as children in past decades. Many now are viewing facts as defined certainty and classified information that was previously shared through newsprint, TV networks maybe even landline phones. But now we're getting it all through social media and these fundamental changes made it easier for recruiters and groomers to create, propagate and amplify information for the sole purpose of undermining confidence in public trust in our democratic institutions, in our teachers or counselors, and parents.

With a keen focus on the youth, these extremist groups with white supremacists at the forefront now point to theories and works of fiction to motivate individuals as a justification to take independent action. With the capability to easily retweet or like or forward generates pathways for amplification of parallelism. False information, I think we all know the famous quote from Churchill - it's halfway around the world before the truth has a chance to get its shoes on and we've come to learn that misinformation may very well be outperforming fast right now. Plots and conspiracies flourish as a substitute for the hard work that, let's say many of us don't do. With the power of the meme, parents, teachers, and counselors have little insight or appreciation of its potential adverse impact and just to talk a little bit about memes. There was a 2009 report on the medic warfare in which dark reclaim that memes have the power to change individual and

group values, and behavior to enhance dysfunctional cultures of subcultures and can act as a contagion.

At first glance, it might seem crazy that one meme could have such power as they've traditionally been used to share ideas, wit, and produce inside jokes that can be shared with others. But memes refer to the image and just so they refer to image macros which are images that quickly convey humor or political thought meant to be shared on social media. I'm sure we've all seen memes and we go after them and sharing memes not only amuses groups, but they can also define groups. Some memes are fast becoming symbols commandeered by extremist movements to instill fear and terror. Violent extremists in white supremacist groups are leveraging online tools and resources to propagate messages of violence in the division. These groups are using the internet to disseminate propaganda, to identify and groom potential recruits, and to supplement their real-world recruiting efforts. So even if we might not see it is happening online. The members and supporters calling mainstream form to see whether individuals might be recruited or encouraged to commit acts of violence to look for opportunities to drop targets into private exchanges and then exploit popular media like music videos and online video games.

Although the Internet offers countless opportunities for Americans to connect, it's also provided violent extremists with access to new audiences, an instrument for radicalization and we have been having a number of briefings surrounding these topics. One included a woman whose son was radicalized by online gaming and ultimately was murdered by his recruiter and considering the horror of that happening to our children. We walk into our living rooms and they're on their games and we think that their safe and sound because they're simply with us, but recognizing that the threat it goes beyond what we can physically see it is crucially important. We also think about something like that Pittsburgh Synagogue Carnage, The Christ Church in El Paso shooting that made all too clear that problem spaces in means our central way in which you may encounter extremist ideas.

Our website you transfer propagating white supremacy and hatred with visited by individuals were some in due course went from flash to bang to your study by the intelligence report so that registered Stormfront users which is a now-defunct white supremacist website Stormfront users have been disproportionately responsible for some of the most lethal hate crimes in mass killings in history. Stormfront members and posters murdered over 100 people in the name of a white supremacist ideology. Recruiters active in the white supremacist militia, another extremist movement, are using similar and highly effective recruiting campaigns. Once leveraged by Isis virtually overnight, a global army of mostly useful foreign fighters departed the safety and security their homes to join a fight thousands of miles from their homes and if the complex challenge requires innovative and during whole community solutions, bolstered by a commitment between all relevant participants at the national and international level and of course also at state and local community level as well at this point. I want to turn it over to Sheriff Daniels to continue the discussion.

## **Mark Daniels**

Thank you, Carie. Thank you, Paul and thank you for the greater introduction and good afternoon everyone. I want to welcome the chairs, vice-chairs, leaders, members, and guests on this call today, and also I want to highlight and thank you Judge Webster for all your leadership

and look forward to working with Chair Bratton and Karen Tandy. I see continued success going forward.

On that note, it's been an honor to serve on this committee. I've learned a lot which I think is very important. I come with the law enforcement perspective and we've been working very hard. We've heard a lot, but the most important people we've heard from is our youth. I think it's so important as they teach us as we get older with a rowdy force so much about what's going on in our younger generation.

Our subcommittee report will be attentive to community efforts that will comprise of law enforcement, the criminal justice system, mental health, NGO educators, academia, and government. All of which are key audiences since they are involved in the entire prevention life cycle from preventative, engaged, through disengagement.

The subcommittee is determined that such information is all too rarely offered and even less frequently updated to reflect changes in extremist scenes. Teachers, administrators, mental health counselors, and law enforcement officials require resources to improve their recognition and awareness of violence. The stream of groups and individuals who propagating racism antisemitic, the forming antigovernment message, in symbols, and recruitment styles as well as their kind of apps and chat functions. Extremists are exploiting these platforms and professionals need to be able to better understand the key emotional drivers that create vulnerabilities to radicalization. Pathways to recognize the signs is not enough as we need to consider establishing programs and how to effectively intervene when they spot warning signs and it is critical to establish local intervention from the whole community effort for that purpose In closing, as most school systems move online, they would need to understand how to shield their online classroom spaces from hackers, extremists, cybercriminals, and groomers. Many fixated on propagating racism. It's a full mix of anti-semantic content. And what do we do? What do you do when students share such content or use names in chat rooms?

We need teachers in media literacy training in ways that go beyond the basics about privacy and cyberbullying. These interventions need to be more expansive and focus on immunizing students and youth against hate-motivated disinformation campaigns as well as providing awareness training that will allow them to recognize conspiracy theories, disinformation, fake news, and key strategy extremists used to manipulate potential recruits. I appreciate being on this committee and I'll turn it back over for final comments.

### **Carrie Lemark**

Thanks, Mark. Just in closing we did put together a youth working group. We give thanks to the new incoming President of the National Police Athletic League. Which I was PAL kid myself in New Jersey. They did a great job and we're really pleased with the work that they did and we are also thankful to have him as a part of our committee. We also work with Cynthia Miller-Idris and American University who's doing just tremendous work in this area, and I want to publicly thank her as well and we will open it up to any questions. Thank you.

### **Mike Miron**

Thank you, Carrie, Paul, and Mark, for those great updates. We're now going to go back to Bob Rose, who's the Chair of the Information and Communication Technology Risk Reduction Subcommittee for their progress report. Mr. Rose the floor is yours, sir.

## **Bob Rose**

Judge Webster, I also want to extend my appreciation and the appreciation of my task force in all that you have done over the years. Thank you very much.

The Homeland Security Advisory Council Information and Communication Technology Risk Reduction subcommittee would like to kind of present the following comments today for consideration. We have a world-class team I could not have been blessed with a better group of subcommittee members headed up with our Steve Adegbite who is the Co-Chair. We were given 4 questions to look at within this committee. What additional steps should be? Should the department take to identify and mitigate its ICT supply chain risks? What is the effectiveness of the department's current efforts and how can it increase the security of its ICT products? Examine whether DHS can better use its full suite cybersecurity, law enforcement trade, and its customs abilities to identify and reduce ICT risks. Lastly, what areas can the department better collaborate with the private sector to increase its shared understanding of supply chain vulnerabilities?

We are putting together our final report and we're about halfway through it at this point in time, we have already touched base and had interviews with 18 members from both the private enterprise and government, including the senior leadership at DHS as well as at the White House, the President's Intelligence Advisory Board, senior people at Google, and other such corporations. These have been significantly helpful in helping us put together our document and providing us numerous people we could talk to in doing so, we have come out with some preliminary recommendations that I will discuss with you or share with you at this point in time.

One of the first dynamic recommendations is that we have is a risk management framework as an effective essential tool for doing this work. We will recommend building off the existing our maps built by other agencies including the DOD. Additionally, since the supply chain surface area is so large, we recommend identifying the highest value and higher risk assets and then work recursively to protect them. There's an opportunity for DHS to use the full suite of cybersecurity authorities to better central cataloging of all jurisdictions which we consider crucial. Another opportunity is creating a standalone function which creates capability that focuses on all jurisdictions on behalf of the department of reducing and limiting ICT risk. Increasing the authorities of the DHS procurement office to align with the mission of reducing ICT risk for the department. We encourage the robust adoption and implementation in government and private sector organizations of select NIST, ISO, and SC security guidelines that seems to make these guidelines consistent.

We want to consider how efforts recommended by the open group trusted technology forum another may be leveraged to enhance public and private ICT supply chain security and how to move such efforts through the ICT process more rapidly and effectively. Additionally, establish and demonstrate how public-private partnerships can share actionable information at speed and scale, and both classified and unclassified formats revitalized and build out insignificant expand

the advanced security framework efforts which are charged by DHS and Co-chaired by DHS and DOD, and incentivize and the establishment of robust domestic and allied ICT supply chains for key critical infrastructure assets through the use of government purchasing power, tax and other government incentive programs to purchase from the supply chains.

These are a highlights of the paper with that we are halfway through presenting formally at our next open meeting. The group is, as I said, it's been tremendous in digging and really trying to do something that is meaningful that will not fit on a shelf that can take advantage of the traction that it's already been done by the Department of Homeland Security and make significant recommendations on moving forward. So that's my presentation for today and want to thank you all of you.

### **Mike Miron**

Thank you, Bob and please stay on the line since you're going to be also speaking next and we appreciate the update. As a reminder, the four subcommittees that just provided their updates are in the process of writing their report. They shared their updates with the council and the public and where they are right now, so with that I'm going to turn it over to vice-chair Karen Tandy, who's going to oversee the next section.

### **Karen Tandy**

Thank you, Mike. I guess the Emerging Technology Subcommittee to brief the council on their Biotechnology report which everyone has received the briefing today and with great gratitude, the Chair of the subcommittee Cathy Lanier and Thad Allen, who could not be with us and Vice-Chair Bob Rose again. So, with that turn it over to you. Cathy.

### **Cathy Lanier**

Thank you all so much. Thank you, Karen. OK, thank you I do want to start off by congratulating Judge Webster for his leadership for so many years and leadership for the country. Lastly, for Judge Webster serving as a role model for so many of us in our careers. So, thank you for your service and congratulations again.

On behalf of our chair Thad Alan we appreciate the time to present our recommendations on biotechnology today. Unfortunately, he is unable to join us today, but he had an important engagement that he could not schedule around. Quite frankly I'm not sure how he is in so many places all the time. He is engaged in so many important projects, but he does regret not being able to be here for the briefing today. As the Secretary has tasked our subcommittee with looking at 6 complex emerging technologies that included unmanned autonomous systems, artificial intelligence, and machine learning, 3D 4D printing fonts, and information science, and quantum computing advanced robotics, and biotechnology. Bob Rose will be presenting his work on the biotechnology, which leaves us with two additional reports on technologies to complete and that would be advanced robotics and quantum computing. Before I turn it over to Bob, I want it to acknowledge Eric and MITRE for once again providing their time and support for our work on

this and all the projects that we've worked on. There have been dozens of looping through, either in person or on the phone, and the leadership, that Garret Conover has provided and always making himself available to us has been nothing short of refreshing in a miracle that he can keep pace with us, but we would not be able to push forward without his support. So, with that I would like to turn it over to Bob for the biotechnology report.

### **Bob Rose**

Thank you, Cathy. Again, I apologize to the those in the audience today from my technology and having to juggle as I have the biotechnology efforts which we have done within emerging markets was probably one of the most complicated of our efforts today. The new emerging technologies pose significant risks and yet exciting opportunities for DHS. These technologies can be grouped into 6 main categories as Cathy mentioned, unmanaged down in the systems artificial intelligence machine learning 3D printing, biotechnology, gene editing and splicing quantum information science and quantum computing, and advanced robotics. As Cathy had mentioned, we're going to talk about our final paper which we are submitting today for approval, and the biotechnology gene editing and splicing. Once again as Cathy said we got tremendous support from the Mitre Corporation who again were extremely helpful in putting together the main focus of this report, is on crisper the clustered regularly interspaced short palindromic repeats, which is a new technique used to manipulate DNA.

As I said, this was one of our more complicated, no, most complicated papers that we put together. We've come up with three main recommendations from the report which I will summarize right now for the group, the first is actively get ahead of advances in gene therapy delivery systems, and crisper. Secondly, create ways to detect whether crisper has been used both accidentally or intentionally, and lastly monitoring develop means to prevent the action or delivery of CRISPR technology in order to prevent unwanted crisper modifications, the impact of this could harm US citizens our food supply, vegetation, wildlife, so it is therefore important to prevent this technology from being used. This is again a brief summary of a very long and expensive paper that we have put together but highlights the key recommendations that we have made and are seeking the support and approval from the committee today to release it and share it with the rest of DHS in a public manner. So that completes my recommendations and summary of the biotechnology gene-editing paper and thank you and I welcome any questions so I have to tell you as this could be difficult for me to go into the depth that maybe some of you may want to.

### **Mike Miron**

Thank you, Bob, I know thank you for pushing through the rest of the video on this project. Thank you, Cathy and Bob thank you so much for your leadership on this and to all of the members of the subcommittee. I can only imagine how daunting this particular one was. So, we're grateful for the guidance that you've given us in this final report. I would just open it up at this time to all of the members of the council. If there are any questions or discussion as a result of this report and for those of you on the phone, star 6 to speak.

Hearing no discussion, I'll move on and ask: is there a motion to approve this final draft report for it to be sent to the Secretary?

Frank motion to approve Thank you.

Is there a second?

Thank you for your second and I'm assuming there are no more discussions and we'll call it to a vote. At this time all of those in favor of the final draft report please indicate by saying I.

Alright. Thank you very much. Any opposed? Any abstentions? Thank you, the motion passes and the final draft report will be sent to the Acting Secretary. At this time, I will turn it over to our Vice-Chair Karen Tandy.

### **Karen Tandy**

I know that Bill would want to thank all of you on the phone and those of us in this room. To repeat everyone, thank you Judge Webster for where you have brought us to this point. On behalf of Commissioner Bratton, I want to welcome our newest members to the Council John Clark, Dr. Cooper, and Dan Kaniewski also with us here today. I would like to start by saying, really, how fortunate we are after an icon like Judge Webster to have the chair of the council be Commissioner Bratton. Having traveled across this country and the service that he has provided to this country we are very fortunate to have you commissioner Bratton taking on the mantle of leadership. I feel awful that I'm closing this out instead of you. OK, we love you. Thank you all and at this point, the meeting is adjourned for those on the line we're sending you just for fun a third link HSAC members that will connect you to the closed session video that you missed.

I hereby certify that, to the best of my knowledge, the foregoing minutes are accurate and complete.

Signed and Dated 11/5/2020

Mike Miron, Acting Executive Director, Homeland Security Advisory Council