

Homeland Security Advisory Council Summary of Meeting

March 7, 2005

The Homeland Security Advisory Council (HSAC) convened at 9:30 am (PST) on December 14, 2004, at The Westin Horton Plaza in San Diego, California.

The HSAC met in San Diego for the purposes of: 1) receiving reports from Senior Advisory Committees; 2) receiving briefings from DHS staff on Departmental initiatives; and 3) holding roundtable deliberations and discussions among HSAC members.

In accordance with the provisions of Public Law 92-463, the meeting was open to the public from 9:30 am to 11:30 am. Following the public session, the Secretary issued a determination that portions of the HSAC meeting concerned matters excluded from the Open Meeting Requirements.

Council Members Attendance:

Joseph J. Grano, Jr., Chair
Judge William Webster, Vice Chair
Duane Ackerman
Richard Andrews
Kathleen Bader
Charles Canterbury
Jared Cohen
Frank J. Cilluffo
Ruth David
MG Bruce Lawlor, USA (ret.)
Mayor Patrick McCrory
Lydia Thomas
Erle Nye
Governor Mitt Romney (*Via conference call*)

U.S. Department of Homeland Security Staff Attendance:

Secretary Tom Ridge
Daniel Ostergaard, Homeland Security Advisory Council, Executive Director
Richard Davis, Homeland Security Advisory Council staff
Jeff Gaynor, Homeland Security Advisory Council staff
Mike Miron, Homeland Security Advisory Council staff
Candance Stoltz, Homeland Security Advisory Council staff
Carlos Kizzee, Office of General Counsel
Jan Burmeister, Homeland Security Advisory Council staff
Jan Mares, Private Sector Office

Public Attendance:

Due to the media interest in the session contents, numerous members of the press were present at the public session. The Department received no comments or matters for consideration from the public.

Reference Materials:

Any reference materials received, issued, or approved by the HSAC have been made available via the HSAC web page at www.dhs.gov/hsac.

Meeting:

Chairman Grano called the HSAC to order and introduced Secretary of Homeland Security, Tom Ridge. Secretary Ridge provided a few opening remarks, thanking council members for contributing their time and reminding the group of the effort involved with securing the homeland. Chairman Grano called for an update from the four Senior Advisory Committees:

1. Private Sector Senior Advisory Committee (PVTSAAC)
As reported by: Kathleen Bader

Further guidance was requested regarding the implementation linkages, the desired outcomes, and the complimentary action plans between Homeland Security Presidential Directive 7 (HSPD7), HSPD-8, and Project Sentinel.

At the request of Chairman Grano, Bader along with Richard Andrews summarized HSPD7, HSPD-8 and Project Sentinel.

The PVTSAAC recommended that private industry be added to the leadership council of HSPD-8 to assist in facilitating the linkage between the public and the private sectors. The PVTSAAC recommended the private sector experts, therefore, be put on the HSPD-8 leadership, steering committee leadership, and further that federal agencies should be directed to consult with the ISACs and with the 13 critical infrastructure group trade associations while assessing national readiness.

At that particular point in time, the PVTSAAC had not been engaged with Project Sentinel other than receiving briefings by the project's working group.

The HSAC agreed with PVTSAAC's recommendations.

2. Academe Policy and Research Senior Advisory Committee (APRSAC)
As reported by: Jared Cohon

HSPD-8 gave a clear mandate to the Secretary to take a leadership role on the issue of education and training for homeland security. The APRSAC believed there were a variety of factors as to what constituted a quality program for homeland security studies. An important step was taken by this HSAC at an earlier meeting this year endorsing the idea of a proposal (modeled with assistance of the U.S. Coast Guard) to hold a conference to consider what would constitute homeland security studies, particularly homeland security strategic studies, and what those guiding principles should look like. That conference was held in November 2004 and produced guiding principles for crafting homeland security studies. The APRSAC discussed them at length and ultimately endorsed them. While the APRSAC proposed revisions, they were not significant in terms of altering the substance, and therefore, the APRSAC recommended the HSAC also endorse these principles.

The APRSAC believed that principles are important, but alone, not enough. The APRSAC also recommended that DHS create a mechanism for coordinating all DHS-funded education and training. Understanding the inefficiency of multiple programs overlapping, the APRSAC believed it is important that DHS first take an inventory of current programs offered.

The APRSAC was also requested to review the Homeland Security Advisory System (HSAS). First created in March 2002, the HSAS continues to evolve. The APRSAC was asked to review the HSAS with a particular focus on the general public as audience. Materials were provided to HSAC members for review but the APRSAC's recommendations were summarized:

- Listen to the public;
- Engage the media; and
- Understand how one communicates.

The APRSAC noted the last recommendation of how one communicates is very complicated, as it is an active area of research. The APRSAC urged DHS to track the research and take advantage of it when it can. Further discussion ensued by HSAC members in regards to HSAS.

The HSAC agreed with APRSAC's recommendations.

3. State and Local Senior Advisory Committee (SLSAC)
As reported by: Governor Mitt Romney

The SLSAC received briefings from the Office for Domestic Preparedness regarding DHS grant funding programs and a number of issues were raised by the SLSAC with regard to the grant process, noting, the new intelligence reform calls for DHS to reconsider ways in which grant funds are provided to the state and local governments.

The SLSAC also held a round table discussion on port security with the San Diego Port Police, the Coast Guard, the City of San Diego and the Chamber of Commerce.

The SLSAC continued to express interest and priority to issues related to training state, local and tribal entities with regards to our homeland security.

In June 2004, Secretary Ridge asked Governor Romney to Chair the Intelligence and Information Sharing Working Group that would define the appropriate role for state, tribal, local, and private sector entities in the collection, analysis, dissemination, and use of this intelligence/information – and how those efforts should be coordinated with those of the federal counterterrorism community.

Materials from the Working Group were distributed to HSAC members. Below are some of the Working Group’s major recommendations:

- Federal, state, tribal, and local authorities must work together with the private sector to assess threat, vulnerability, risk and consequence.
- The Federal Government should emphasize providing current and actionable and unclassified information. The emphasis should not be on providing security clearances and forcing related security costs on state and local governments and officials.
- The Federal government needs to develop a reliable and organized conduit for providing information to states, tribes, and localities.
- State, tribal, and local governments need to collect, analyze, disseminate and use intelligence/information as part of their day-to-day operations.
- Each State should establish an information center that serves as a 24/7 “all-source,” multi-disciplinary, information fusion center (to be further investigated by the Working Group).

Governor Romney acknowledged that Federal information sharing with the private sector was not its primary focus. The Working Group did recommend that an HSAC Private Sector Information Sharing Working Group be formed to focus specifically on Homeland Security Information sharing with the private sector.

The HSAC agreed with the SLSAC and Working Group recommendations in its Final Report.

4. The Emergency Response Senior Advisory Committee (ERSAC)
As reported by: Richard Andrews

At the September meeting, the ERSAC was briefed on and reported the Department’s progress to date with the implementation of Homeland Security Presidential Decision -8 (HSPD-8), National Preparedness. In response, Secretary Ridge requested the ERSAC review ongoing efforts and provide

recommendations on how the implementation of HSPD-8 could be made as effective as possible.

The ERSAC met in Washington, DC for two days in November and met again on the issue on December 13, 2004.

While recognizing they were designed to engage Federal resources, the ERSAC believed the HSPD-8 scenarios developed by the Homeland Security Council were too complex and devastating in scope and needed to be revisited to preclude a repeat of the “what’s the sense” reaction experienced during the Civil Defense Era when communities were tasked to deal with thermonuclear detonations that would completely obliterate everything for miles beyond their areas of responsibility. The ERSAC also recommended stressing the importance of regional cooperation in the execution of HSPD-8 requirements. Additionally, the ERSAC believed that the satisfaction of HSPD-8 requirements must be based on an objectively measurable performance-based assessment methodology. Noting that the HSPD-8 effort is complex and unprecedented in the Nation’s history, the ERSAC recommended that the Department effectively “roll-out” HSPD-8 to ensure comprehensive public understanding of its provisions and objectives. Finally, the ERSAC recommended a special working group be created between the private sector and public sector to further discuss the implementation of HSPD-8.

The ERSAC stated HSPD-8 is fundamental to the successful implementation of a national homeland security strategy. The ERSAC recognized HSPD-8 implementation will be of interest to the private and public sectors and that it will continue to focus on such issues and report back to the HSAC as appropriate.

The HSAC agreed with the ERSAC recommendations.

The meeting was adjourned at 11:30 am PST.

I hereby certify that, to the best of my knowledge, the foregoing minutes are accurate and complete.

Joseph J. Grano, Jr.
Chairman
Homeland Security Advisory Council